

Michael Faure
Helmut Koziol (eds.)

Cases on Medical Malpractice
in a Comparative Perspective

With Contributions by

Herman Cousy	Maria Manuel Veloso
Christian Dahlman	Franz Michael Petry
Miek De Graeve	Horton Rogers
Michael Faure	Gottfried Schiemann
Suzanne Galand-Carval	Jorge Sinde Monteiro
Heinz Hausheer	Shirin Slabbers
Bernhard A. Koch	Carel Stolker
Helmut Koziol	Lotta Wendel

SpringerWienNewYork

Table of Contents

List of Contributors.....	XVIII
I. Introduction.....	1
A. PROBLEM DEFINITION.....	1
B. METHODOLOGY.....	2
1. Case Studies.....	2
2. Comparative Law.....	2
3. Economic Analysis.....	3
C. FRAMEWORK OF THE PROJECT.....	3
D. COLLABORATORSINTHEPROJECT.....	3
E. STRUCTURE OF THIS PROJECT.....	4
II. Cases and Background.....	5
A. CASE1.....	5
1. Facts of the Case.....	5
2. Allegation of the Plaintiff Which Has Not Been Verified.....	6
3. Reasons for the Decision.....	6
B. CASE2.....	7
1. Facts of the Case.....	7
2. Allegations of the Plaintiff Which Have Not Been Verified.....	8
3. Allegations of the Hospital and the Responsible Physician Which Have Not Been Verified ..."	9
4. Statement of the Expert Appointed by the Court.....	9
5. Statement of the Plaintiff During the Interrogation.....	9
6. Witness Statement of the Plaintiff's Son.....	9
7. Statement of the Physician Who Had Informed the Patient.....	9
8. Further Remarks.....	10
9. Operative Provisions of the Judgement.....	10
10. Reasons for the Decision.....	10
C. CASE 3.....	13
1. Facts of the Case.....	13
2. Allegations of the Plaintiff Which Have Not Been Verified.....	15
3. Allegations of the Hospital Carrier and the Physician in Charge Which Have Not Been Verified.....	15
4. Statements of the Experts Appointed by the Court.....	15

5.	Operative Provisions of the Judgement.....	16
6.	Reasons for the Court Decision.....	16
7.	Based on the General Judgement the Following Damages Were Determined (Estimated).....	18
D.	CASE4.....	19
1.	Facts of the Case.....	19
2.	Allegation of the Plaintiff Which Has Not Been Verified.....	19
3.	Allegation of the Defendant (Hospital in Which the Medical Treatment Was Performed).....	19
4.	Statements of the Experts Appointed by the Court.....	19
5.	Other.....	20
6.	Operative Provisions of the Judgement.....	20
7.	Reasons for the Court Decision.....	20
8.	Based on the General Judgement the Following Damages Were Determined (Estimated).....	21
E.	CASE 5.....	22
1.	Facts of the Case.....	22
2.	Allegations of the Plaintiff Which Have Not Been Verified.....	22
3.	Allegations of the Defendant Which Have Not Been Verified.....	23
4.	Statements of the Experts Appointed by the Court.....	23
5.	Additional Remarks.....	23
6.	Operative Provisions of the Judgement.....	24
7.	Reasons for the Court Decision.....	24
8.	Based on the General Judgement the Following Damages Were Determined.....	26
F.	CASE6.....	27
1.	Facts of the Case.....	27
2.	Allegations of the Plaintiff Which Have Not Been Verified.....	28
3.	Allegations of the Defendants 1-4 Which Have Not Been Verified.....	28
4.	Statements of the Experts Appointed by the Court.....	28
5.	Operative Provisions of the Judgement.....	28
6.	Reasons for the Court Decision.....	29
G.	MEDICAL PRACTITIONERS' LIABILITY IN GERMAN LAW.....	34
1.	Procedural Law.....	34
a)	Appeal to the Arbitration Panel.....	34
b)	Plaintiff.....	34
c)	Annuities.....	34
d)	The Patient's Right to Inspect His Medical Records.....	34
e)	Providing Substance for the Claim/Ascertainment of the Facts at Court and Ascertainment of the Damage.....	35
f)	Facilitation of the Ascertainment of Causation and Loss.....	35
2.	Basis for Claims in Medical Liability Law.....	35
a)	Contractual Liability.....	35
i.	Complete Hospital Admission Contract (if Necessary, with Added Physician Contract).....	36
ii.	Split Hospital Admission Contract.....	36
iii.	Physicians Hiring Beds and Nursing Services From the Hospital.....	36

b) Tort Liability.....	36
3. Liability Due to Treatment Errors.....	37
a) General Remarks.....	37
b) Standard of Due Care.....	37
c) Typical Treatment Errors.....	38
i. Wrong Diagnosis.....	38
ii. Wrong Choice of Treatment Method.....	39
iii. Liability for Taking Over the Treatment.....	39
iv. Informed Consent Process for the Selection of Therapy.....	39
d) Individual Questions.....	40
i. Distribution of Liability According to the Division of Work ...	40
(i) Vertical Work-Sharing.....	40
(ii) Horizontal Work-Sharing.....	41
ii. Liability of the Professional Beginner and Liability for the Professional Beginner.....	42
iii. Liability Arising From Organizational Faults.....	42
e) Presenting Evidence and Burden of Proof.....	43
i. The Basics.....	43
ii. Gross Treatment Errors.....	44
iii. Easing of the Burden of Proof Because of Organizational Faults ..	45
(i) Surgery Performed by a Beginner (Physician-in-Training)...	45
(ii) Risks Which Can Be Completely Controlled.....	45
(iii) Easing of the Burden of Proof Based on the Duty to Establish the Diagnosis and Confirming It.....	46
iv. Easing of the Burden of Proof in Cases of Failure to Document.....	46
4. Liability Based on an Insufficient Informed Consent Process Concerning Surgery and the Risks Involved.....	47
5. Compensation as a Legal Consequence.....	50
a) Pecuniary Damage.....	50
i. Costs for Healing Treatment.....	50
ii. Loss of Income.....	50
iii. Additional Needs.....	51
b) Non-Material Damage.....	51
6. Social Insurance Law.....	52
a) Compulsory Health Insurance.....	52
i. Insured Persons.....	52
ii. Benefits of the Health Insurance.....	52
b) Compulsory Pension Insurance.....	53
i. Insured Persons.....	53
ii. Benefits of Pension Insurance.....	53
(i) Pension Benefits for Reduced Earning Capacity.....	53
iii. Pension in the Event of Death.....	54
c) Social Nursing Care Insurance.....	54
i. Persons Insured.....	54
ii. Benefits of Nursing Care Insurance.....	54
d) Recourse Possibilities of the Social Security Insurance Providers, § 116 SGB X.....	54
e) Support for the Insured to Enforce Claims for the Payment of Damages.....	55
7. List of References.....	55

III. Country Reports.....	57
A. AUSTRIA.....	57
1. Case 1.....	57
a) Contractual Liability of the First Defendant in General.....	57
b) Tort Liability of the Second Defendant in General.....	59
c) Contractual Duties of Information.....	61
i. Form of the Information.....	61
ii. Contents and Extent of the Necessary Information.....	62
iii. Basic Information as Minimum Requirement?.....	64
iv. Time of the Information.....	64
v. Conclusions for the Instant Case.....	65
d) Damages for Pain and Suffering.....	65
2. Case 2.....	67
a) Contractual Duties of Information.....	67
i. The Formulation of the Risk.....	67
ii. Language Skills of the Patient.....	68
iii. Information about Alternatives of Treatment.....	68
b) Contractual Liability of the First Defendant.....	69
i. Violation of the Duty to Inform the Patient.....	69
ii. Intervening Causation in Case of a Predisposition of the Patient.....	69
c) Tort Liability of the Second Defendant.....	70
d) Damages for Pain and Suffering.....	70
3. Case 3.....	71
a) Tort Liability of the First Defendant.....	71
b) Contractual Liability of the Second Defendant.....	72
i. The Contract's Scope of Protection.....	72
ii. Breach of a Duty of Care.....	72
iii. Proof of Causation.....	73
c) Damages.....	74
i. Pain and Suffering.....	74
ii. Other Damages.....	75
4. Case 4.....	75
a) Contractual Liability of the Defendants.....	75
i. Prima Facie Evidence or Reversal of Burden of Proof.....	75
ii. Inadequate Documentation of the Treatment.....	76
iii. Conclusions for the Instant Case.....	77
b) Damages for Pain and Suffering.....	77
5. Case 5.....	78
a) Contractual Liability of the Defendants.....	78
i. The Child's Right of Action.....	78
ii. Burden of Proof for Causation.....	78
iii. Conclusions for the Instant Case.....	80
b) Damages for Pain and Suffering.....	80
6. Case 6.....	80
a) Contractual Liability of the First Defendant.....	80
b) Tort Liability of the Second Defendant.....	81
c) Damages for Pain and Suffering.....	82
7. List of References.....	82
B. BELGIUM.....	84

1. Introduction.....	84
2. The Different Kinds of Liability.....	84
a) The Contractual Liability of the Physician/Hospital.....	84
i. The Treatment Contract Between the Physician and the Patient....	85
(i) The Diagnosis.....	85
(ii) The Obligation to Inform the Patient.....	86
(iii) The Treatment.....	87
(iv) The After Treatment Care.....	87
(v) Liability for the Negligent Acts of His Medical Team.....	87
ii. Hospital Admission Contract.....	88
(i) The Accommodation.....	88
(ii) The Nourishment.....	88
(iii) The Medical Staff.....	88
(iv) The Infrastructure.....	88
b) The Tort Liability of the Physician/Hospital.....	89
i. Liability of the Physician for His Medical Acts (Art. 1382 CC) and for Those of His Own Staff (Art. 1384, 3 CC).....	89
ii. Liability of the Hospital for Its Own Acts (Art. 1382 CC) and Those of Its Medical Staff (Art. 1384, 3 CC).....	90
c) Criminal Liability :	90
3. The Burden of Proof.....	91
a) The Fault of the Physician/Hospital.....	91
b) The Damage.....	91
c) Causal Connection.....	91
d) Is the Burden of Proof Shared Between the Patient and the Physician in Belgium?.....	92
4. The Compensation of the Damage Sustained.....	92
5. Case 1: The Improper Informed Consent of the Patient.....	93
a) The Facts and Problems.....	93
b) Belgian Law.....	93
6. Case 2: Improper Informed Consent of the Patient.....	94
a) The Facts and Problems.....	94
b) Belgian Law.....	94
7. Case 3: The Post-Treatment Obligation.....	95
a) The Facts and Problems.....	95
b) Belgian Law.....	95
i. Moral and Material Damages.....	96
(i) General Rule.....	96
(ii) The Present Case.....	96
ii. Aesthetical Damages.....	96
iii. Loss of Enjoyment of Life.....	97
iv. Compensation for the Loss of a Chance of a Better Medical Result.....*	97
v. The Parents.....	97
8. Case 4: Deviation From the Standard of the Prudent and Competent Physician.....	97
a) The Facts and Problems.....	97
b) Belgian Law.....	97
9. Case 5: Deviation From the Standard of the Prudent and Competent Physician/Deviation From the Standard of the Careful Hospital.....	98

a) The Facts and Problems.....	98
b) Belgian Law.....	98
10. Case 6: Deviation From the Standard of the Competent Physician and the Efficient Hospital.....	99
a) The Facts and Problems.....	99
b) Belgian Law.....	99
1 1. List of References.....	100
C. FRANCE.....	102
1. Introduction.....	102
a) Structure of the French Law of Torts/Consequences in the Field of Medical Liability.....	102
b) General Principles Governing Liability for Medical Activities.....	103
i. Civil Liability.....	103
ii. Administrative Liability.....	103
2. Case 1.....	104
a) Private Law.....	105
i. Fault.....	105
ii. Causation.....	106
iii. Who is Liable?	108
b) Public Law/Prospects of Evolution in Private Law.....	108
3. Case 2.....	110
4. Case 3.....	112
(i) Fault.....	114
(ii) Causation.....	114
5. Case 4.....	116
6. Case 5.....	117
7. Case 6.....	119
8. Appendix: Indications Concerning the Quantum of Damages in Cases 3 and 5.....	120
9. List of References.....	122
D. GERMANY.....	123
1. Case 1.....	123
2. Case 2.....	127
3. Case 3.....	130
4. Case 4.....	133
5. Case 5.....	136
6. Case 6.....	139
7. Summary and Conclusions.....	141
8. List of References.....	145
E. THE NETHERLANDS.....	146
1. Introduction.....	146
2. The New Dutch Medical Services Act in a Nutshell.....	147
3. Minors.....	149
a) Minors Aged 16 and Over.....	149
b) Minors Aged 12 to 16.....	149
4. Medical Liability and the Medical Services Act.....	150
5. Information Errors.....	151
a) Scope of the Duty to Provide Information.....	151
b) Who Should Provide the Information and When?.....	152

c) Has the Patient Understood the Information?.....	153
6. Treatment Errors.....	153
7. Defective Devices, Equipment etc.....	155
8. Causation.....	156
a) Sine qua non Connection: The Lost Chance Theory.....	156
b) Imputation on the Basis of Reasonableness.....	157
c) Causal Connection in the Event of Information Errors.....	158
9. Damage.....	159
10. Division of Burden of Proof.....	161
a) Burden of Proof Lies with the Patient, But.....	161
b) Other Methods of Lightening the Burden of Proof.....	161
11. Who is Liable in the Event of a Medical Error?.....	162
a) General Provisions: Book 6 Civil Code.....	162
b) Central Liability: Medical Services Act.....	163
12. Statute of Limitations.....	164
13. Insurability.....	165
14. Discussion of the Cases.....	165
a) Case 1.....	165
b) Case 2.....	166
c) Case 3.....	167
d) Case 4.....	168
e) Case 5.....	169
f) Case 6.....	170
15. List of References.....	171
F. PORTUGAL.....	172
1. General Remarks.....	172
2. Conditions of Responsibility.....	172
a) Legitimacy.....	172
b) Contractual/Extra-Contractual Liability.....	173
c) Wrongfulness.....	174
d) Fault.....	176
e) Causation.....	177
3. Compensation.....	178
a) Non-Pecuniary Loss.....	178
b) Pecuniary Loss.....	179
4. Social Security Law.....	179
a) National Health Service.....	179
b) Social Security Law.....	180
c) Insurance Law.....	180
i. Professional Insurance.....	180
ii. Private Health Insurance.....	180
5. Cases.....	181
a) Case 1.....	181
b) Case 2.....	183
c) Case 3.....	183
d) Case 4.....	185
e) Case 5.....	185
f) Case 6.....	186
5. List of References.....	186
G. SWEDEN.....	188

1. General Description of the Swedish Health Care Legislation	188
2. Patients Rights.....	188
a) Introduction.....	188
b) The Right to Become a Patient.....	189
c) Informed Consent etc.....	189
d) The Right to Good and Competent Care.....	190
e) The Right to Choose Between Alternatives.....	190
3. The Right to Compensation for Damage.....	191
a) Tort Liability.....	191
i. General Remarks.....	191
ii. Informed Consent.....	191
iii. Erroneous Diagnosis.....	193
iv. Other Forms of Malpractice.....	193
b) Patient Insurance.....	194
i. General Remarks.....	194
ii. Right to Compensation.....	195
iii. The Main Limits to and Exceptions From the Right to Compensation.....	196
(i) Side-Effects of Drugs.....	196
(ii) Underlying Illness.....	196
(iii) Necessary Risk-Taking.....	196
(iv) Time Limits.....	196
iv. Calculating the Compensation.....	197
4. Comments on the Cases.....	197
a) Introduction.....	197
b) Case 1.....	198
c) Case 2.....	198
d) Case 3.....	199
e) Case 4.....	199
f) Case 5.....	199
g) Case 6.....	200
5. List of References.....	200
H. SWITZERLAND.....	201
1. Preliminary Remarks.....	201
2. Liability Due to Lack of Adequate Information (Cases 1 and 2).....	201
a) The Various Objectives of Information.....	201
b) Lack of Adequate Information.....	203
i. General Remarks.....	203
ii. Information on Intended Measures in Particular.....	205
(i) Contents and Extent in General.....	205
(ii) Information on Possible Risks in Particular.....	206
(iii) Limits of Information on the Intended Measures.....	208
(iv) Hypothetical Consent of the Patient.....	209
iii. The Form of Information.....	210
(i) The Person in Charge of Information and the Time of Providing Information.....	210
(ii) Securing Evidence on Information.....	210
c) Cases 1 and 2 from a Swiss Perspective.....	212
3. Proof of a Causal Violation of a Duty of Care: Burden of Proof, Facilitation of Proof and Securing Proof (Cases 3-6).....	213
a) Medical Malpractice in a Narrower Sense.....	213

b)	Causal Violations of a Duty of Care, Their Consequences, and Burden of Proof.....	214
i.	Violation of a Duty of Care as a General Requirement of Liability.....	214
ii.	Adequate Causation of the Violation.....	214
iii.	Burden of Proof.....	215
(i)	Burden of Proving Medical Malpractice.....	215
(ii)	Burden of Proving Adequate Causation of Medical Malpractice.....	216
iv.	Facilitation of Proof.....	216
(i)	Proof of Probabilities.....	216
(ii)	Additional Presumption of Malpractice as a Presumption of Fact?.....	216
(iii)	Procedural Duty of the Opposing Party to Cooperate.....	217
v.	Duty to Secure Evidence.....	217
(i)	Securing Evidence of Malpractice.....	218
(ii)	Legal Consequences of Inadequately Securing Evidence ..	218
c)	Cases 3-6 in the Light of Recent Cases Before the Swiss Bundesgericht.....	219
4.	The Relationship Between Practitioner and Hospital (Case 5).....	220
a)	Liability of Private Hospitals.....	220
b)	Liability of Public Hospitals.....	220
I.	Types of Claims.....	220
ii.	Public Law Liability for Medical Malpractice.....	221
iii.	The Upcoming Revision of Swiss Tort Law.....	223
c)	Case 5 From the Perspective of Current and Upcoming Swiss Law.....	223
5.	List of References.....	224
I.	UNITED KINGDOM: ENGLAND.....	226
1.	Introduction.....	226
2.	Cases 1 and 2 - General.....	226
3.	Case 3.....	231
4.	Case 4.....	233
5.	Case 5.....	235
6.	Case 6.....	238
7.	Appendix 1. English Law Compared with the Overview of German Law in Relation to Matters Not Covered Above.....	239
a)	Section 1 (a). Arbitration Panel.....	239
b)	Section 1 (b).....	240
c)	Section 1 (c).....	240
d)	Section 1 (d).....	240
e)	Section 1 (e).....	241
f)	Section 2 (a).....	241
g)	Section 2 (b). Tort Liability.....	242
h)	Section 3. Fault in General.....	243
i.	The Individual Doctor.....	243
ii.	The Hospital.....	243
i)	Section 5. Compensation.....	243
i.	How Are Damages Paid?.....	243
ii.	Assessment of Damages.....	244
8.	Appendix 2.....	244

9. List of References.....	266
IV. Comparative Analysis.....	267
A. INTRODUCTION.....	267
B. CASES: COMPARATIVESUMMARY.....	268
1. Cases I and 2: Duty to Disclose.....	268
a) Summary of the Contents of the Cases.....	268
b) Contents of the Duty to Inform.....	269
c) Burden of Proof of Disclosure.....	272
d) Informed Consent Forms.....	272
e) The Relevance of the Language.....	273
f) Timeliness of Information.....	274
g) Consequences of a Lack of Information.....	274
h) Causation.....	276
i) Results of Case 1.....	278
j) Case 2.....	279
2. Cases 3-6: Professional Fault.....	280
a) A Brief Summary of the Contents of the Cases.....	280
b) Norm for Professional Behaviour.....	282
c) Financial Limits as Excuse?.....	283
d) Burden of Proof of a Violation.....	284
e) Lack of Documentation.....	285
f) Causation.....	286
g) Results of the Cases.....	287
i. Case 3.....	288
ii. Case 4.....	288
iii. Case 5.....	289
iv. Case 6.....	289
3. Comparative Results.....	290
a) Statutes and Case Law.....	290
b) Disclosure of Information.....	290
c) Standard of Care and Burden of Proof.....	291
d) Causation.....	292
e) Channelling of Liability?.....	292
f) Non-Pecuniary Loss.....	292
g) Social Insurance Carriers.....	293
h) Germany: Patient Protection on Top!.....	293
C. A FEW ECONOMIC OBSERVATIONS.....	294
1. Introduction.....	294
2. Effects of Increased Liability.....	294
a) Liability as an Incentive System.....	294
b) Negligence Versus Strict Liability.....	295
c) The Coase Theorem.....	296
3. Insurance.....	299
a) Curing "Moral Hazard".....	299
b) Towards an Insurance Crisis?.....	299
c) Self Insurance.....	300
D. ALTERNATIVES?.....	301
1. First-Party Patient Insurance.....	301

2. Compensation Fund.....	303
3. Examples: Belgium, Vienna, Sweden.....	304
4. Social Security or Tort Law?.....	305
E. HARMONIZATION.....	306
1. Economic Reasons for Harmonization?.....	306
2. Is Harmonization Possible?.....	308
F. LIST OF REFERENCES.....	309
V. Deficiency of Regulation and Approach to Solutions: Conclusions from the Comparative Research.....	311
A. DEFICIENCY OF REGULATION.....	311
B; DEFICIENCIES INHERENT IN THE SYSTEM.....	312
C. DEFICIENCIES BY COMPARATIVE LAW.....	313
D. DEFICIENCY BY LEGAL POLICY.....	314
E. CONSIDERATIONS REGARDING FUTURE DEVELOPMENTS.....	316
F. LIST OF REFERENCES.....	322
Index,.....	325