

HEALTH PLAN

The Only Practical
Solution to the Soaring
Cost of Medical Care

ALAIN C. ENTHOVEN

MARRINER S. ECCLES PROFESSOR

Public and Private Management

Stanford University School of Business



ADDISON-WESLEY PUBLISHING COMPANY

Reading, Massachusetts • Menlo Park, California
London • Amsterdam • Don Mills, Ontario • Sydney

CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION AND SUMMARY	xv
THE GROWTH OF HEALTH CARE SPENDING	xv
CAUSES OF INCREASED SPENDING	xvii
THE REAL ANSWER: FUNDAMENTAL REFORM	xxi
 CHAPTER 1: WHAT MEDICAL CARE IS AND ISN'T	 1
SEVEN MISCONCEPTIONS ABOUT MEDICAL CARE	1
WHY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES MAKE A DIFFERENCE	9
WHY THE CASUALTY INSURANCE MODEL DOESN'T FIT MEDICAL CARE WELL	10
 CHAPTER 2: IRRATIONAL INCENTIVES AND THE GROWTH OF HEALTH CARE SPENDING	 13
THE GROWTH OF HEALTH CARE SPENDING AND THE CHANGING PATTERN OF FINANCE	13
Growth of Spending	13
Changing Sources of Funds	14
What Is the Problem?	15
MAIN CAUSES OF SPENDING INCREASE	16
No Rewards for Economy	16
Growth and Impact of Insurance Coverage	17
Impact of the Tax Laws	19
Fee for Service	21
The Key Role of the Physician	23
Cost Reimbursement for Hospitals	24
The Passive Role of Third-Party Payors	25
More Doctors	24
Technology	28
Aging Population	31
Other Causes	31
ARE DEDUCTIBLES AND COINSURANCE THE SOLUTION?	32
 CHAPTER 3: CUTTING COST WITHOUT CUTTING THE QUALITY OF CARE	 37
REGIONAL CONCENTRATION OF SURGERY AND OTHER SERVICES	37
Open-Heart Surgery	37

Maternity	41
Other Services	41
MATCHING RESOURCES USED TO THE NEEDS OF THE POPULATION SERVED	42
CURTAILING "FLAT-OF-THE-CURVE" MEDICINE	45
Diminishing Marginal Returns Explained	45
Wide Variations in Per Capita Use of Services, with No Discernible Difference in Health	46
Length of Hospital Stay for Heart Attack Patients	46
Second Opinions for Surgery	47
Electronic Fetal Monitoring	48
The Need for Benefit-Cost Analysis	49
A Consumer- versus Provider-Oriented Concept of Quality	50
THE CONTROLLED INTRODUCTION OF NEW TECHNOLOGY	51
SIMPLE COST CONSCIOUSNESS	53
Equivalent Care in Less Costly Sites	53
Duplicate Tests, Excessive Hospital Stays, Sheer Waste	54
CHAPTER 4: ALTERNATIVE FINANCING AND DELIVERY SYSTEMS	55
THE HMO ACT AND THE IDEA OF ALTERNATIVE DELIVERY SYSTEMS	55
EXAMPLES OF ALTERNATIVE DELIVERY SYSTEMS	57
Prepaid Group Practice	57
Individual Practice Association	61
Primary Care Network	64
THE SIGNIFICANCE OF ORGANIZED SYSTEMS OF MEDICAL CARE	67
GOOD HMOs, BAD HMOs, AND THE HMO UNDERSERVICE ISSUE	68
CHAPTER 5: ECONOMIC COMPETITION AMONG HEALTH CARE FINANCING AND DELIVERY SYSTEMS: PRINCIPLES AND EXPERIENCE	70
PRINCIPLES OF FAIR ECONOMIC COMPETITION	71
Multiple Choice	71
Fixed Dollar Subsidies	71
Same Rules for All Competitors	72
Doctors in Competing Economic Units	72
CURRENT LACK OF FAIR ECONOMIC COMPETITION IN HEALTH SERVICES	72
Economic Competition Explained	72

Most People Don't Have Multiple Choice	73
Most People Don't Get Fixed Dollar Subsidies	75
Different Rules for Different Competitors	77
Most Doctors Are Not in Competing Economic Units	77
WHY WE CANNOT HAVE A COMPLETELY FREE MARKET IN HEALTH INSURANCE	78
"Free Riders"	78
Preferred-Risk Selection	80
Income Distribution	81
Information Cost	81
EXPERIENCE WITH HEALTH PLAN COMPETITION	82
The Federal Employees' Health Benefits Program (FEHBP)	82
Hawaii	84
Minneapolis-St. Paul	85
Project Health, Multnomah County, Oregon	88
WHAT CAN WE EXPECT FROM THE FAIR ECONOMIC COMPETITION OF ALTERNATIVE DELIVERY SYSTEMS?	89
 CHAPTER 6: WHY PRICE CONTROLS AND SIMILAR CONTROLS DON'T REDUCE HEALTH CARE COSTS	93
REGULATION AS A SUBSTITUTE FOR APPROPRIATE ECONOMIC INCENTIVES	93
PRICE CONTROLS ON HOSPITALS: HOSPITAL-COST CONTAINMENT	95
HEALTH PLANNING AND CERTIFICATE OF NEED	101
CONTROLS OF PHYSICIANS' FEES	105
UTILIZATION REVIEW AND PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS REVIEW ORGANIZATIONS	108
REGULATION VERSUS COMPETITION	110
 CHAPTER 7: CONSUMER CHOICE HEALTH PLAN	114
BACKGROUND	114
MAIN IDEAS	115
Universal Health Insurance Independent of Job Status: Consumer-Centered Rather than Job- Centered Health Insurance	115
Equitable Distribution of Public Funds	117
Reform Through Incentives	118
Make the Market Work	119
Demonstrated Practical Experience	119
THE FINANCING SYSTEM	119
Actuarial Categories and Costs	119
Tax Credits	121

Vouchers for the Poor	123
Medicare	124
Regional Differences	126
CREATING A SOCIALLY DESIRABLE COMPETITION: CRITERIA FOR QUALIFIED HEALTH PLANS	126
Open Enrollment	127
Community Rating	127
Basic Health Services	127
Premium Rating by Market Area	128
Low Option	128
"Catastrophic Expense Protection"	129
Information Disclosure	129
Health Plan Identification Card	130
FEDERAL-STATE ROLES IN FINANCING AND ADMINISTRATION	130
SPECIAL CATEGORIES—DEFENSE DEPARTMENT, VETERANS, INDIANS, MIGRANTS, THE UNDERWORLD, ILLEGAL ALIENS, NONENROLLERS, OTHERS	131
Beneficiaries of Public Direct-Care Systems	131
Migrants, Derelicts, the Underworld, Illegal Aliens, Nonenrollers, Others	131
TRANSITION	132
PUBLIC POLICY TOWARD DELIVERY-SYSTEM REFORM	133
COSTS AND THE FEDERAL BUDGET	134
CCHP: SOME ISSUES AND ANSWERS	137
Speed of Reorganization	137
"Consumer Choice"	138
Fairness to the Poor	139
Underserved Rural Areas	140
"WHAT'S IN IT FOR ME?"	140
TWO MAJOR PROBLEMS	142
Government as Gatekeeper	142
Discontinuity	144
CHAPTER 8: STEPS TOWARD COMPREHENSIVE REFORM	145
REQUIRE EMPLOYERS TO OFFER EMPLOYEES CHOICES	145
REQUIRE EQUAL FIXED-DOLLAR EMPLOYER CONTRIBUTIONS	148
STANDARDS FOR ALL HEALTH-BENEFITS PLANS	149
FREEDOM OF CHOICE IN MEDICARE	150
A LIMIT ON TAX-FREE EMPLOYER CONTRIBUTIONS	150

FAVORABLE RESPONSE FROM KEY MEMBERS OF CONGRESS	151
FURTHER STEPS	153
CONCLUDING REMARKS	154
 APPENDIX: SUMMARY AND ANALYSIS OF OTHER LEADING NATIONAL HEALTH INSURANCE PROPOSALS	 157
THE KENNEDY PLANS	158
Health Security	158
Health Care for All Americans	161
MANDATED EMPLOYER-PROVIDED INSURANCE FOR THE EMPLOYED AND PUBLIC INSURANCE FOR ALL OTHERS	167
The Nixon Proposal	167
The Carter Proposal	168
Discussion	170
GOVERNMENT AS UNIVERSAL THIRD-PARTY PAYOR	170
 NOTES	 173
 INDEX	 183