

Rights Before Courts

A Study of Constitutional Courts in Postcommunist States of Central and Eastern Europe

By

Wojciech Sadurski

European University Institute Florence,

Italy

and

University of Sydney,

Australia

 **Springer**

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	ix
-------------------------	-----------

Preface	xi
----------------	-----------

PART I

1. THE MODEL OF CONSTITUTIONAL REVIEW IN CENTRAL AND EASTERN EUROPE: AN OVERVIEW	1
---	----------

1. The Emergence of the Current Model	1
2. The Powers of Constitutional Courts and Initiators of the Review Process	5
3. The Tenure and Selection of Judges	14
4. Constitutional Courts' Pursuit of a Monopoly over Constitutional Adjudication	19
5. Conclusions	25

2. CONSTITUTIONAL COURTS IN SEARCH OF LEGITIMACY	27
---	-----------

1. The Legitimacy Dilemma	27
2. Constitutional Courts Between the Judicial and Legislative Branch	33
3. Why the "Continental" Model of Review: Reasons or Rationalisations?	40
4. Constitutional Courts as Protectors of Minorities?	58
5. Conclusions	62

3. THE MODEL OF JUDICIAL REVIEW AND ITS IMPLICATIONS	65
---	-----------

1. Abstract Review	65
2. Ex-Post Review	74
3. Final Review	79
4. Conclusions	85

4. CONSTITUTIONAL COURTS AND LEGISLATION	87
---	-----------

1. The Impact of Constitutional Courts on Law-Making	87
2. Determinants of the "Strength" of Judicial Review	90
3. Constitutional Court and the Parliamentary Minority	93
4. The Question of Judicial Activism and Restraint	96
5. Conclusions	104

PART II

5. JUDICIAL REVIEW AND PROTECTION OF CONSTITUTIONAL RIGHTS	107
---	------------

1. Two Theories about Judicial Review	109
2. The Fact-Sensitivity of a Theory of Judicial Review	114

3. Rights Protection and Disagreement about Rights	118
4. Prudence and Judicial Review	124
5. Conclusions	125
6. PERSONAL, CIVIL AND POLITICAL RIGHTS AND LIBERTIES	127
1. A Right to Life and Dignity	128
2. Freedom of Religion	135
3. The Right to Privacy	146
4. Freedom of Movement and the Right to Choice of Residence	149
5. Citizenship and Voting Rights	151
6. Freedom of Petition, Assembly and Association	156
7. Freedom of Expression	158
8. Conclusions	169
7. SOCIO-ECONOMIC RIGHTS	171
1. Controversy Around Socio-Economic Rights	173
2. Constitutional Catalogues of Socio-Economic Rights	176
3. The Status of Socio-Economic Rights	178
4. The Drawing of Distinctions Between Different Types of Rights by the Courts: Social Security Cases	181
5. The Right to Work	185
6. Rights to Health and Education	189
7. Conclusions	190
8. EQUALITY AND MINORITY RIGHTS	195
1. Equality and Constitutional Review	195
2. Gender and Sexual Orientation Equality	199
3. Special Case of Affirmative Action	203
4. Minority Issues in Central and Eastern Europe: An Overview	205
5. Constitutional Design of Minority Rights: Group or Individual Rights?	207
6. Linguistic Rights	212
7. The Special Case of Minority Representation in Public Authorities	218
8. Conclusions	222
9. "DECOMMUNISATION", "LUSTRATION", AND CONSTITUTIONAL CONTINUITY	223
1. Main Dilemmas Raised by Decommunisation and Lustration Laws	224
2. Lustration and Decommunisation in Central and Eastern Europe	234
3. Retroactive Extensions of Statutes of Limitation	249
4. Conclusions: Transitional Justice and Constitutional Continuity	258
10. RESTRICTIONS OF RIGHTS	263
1. Constitutional Design of Limits on Rights	263

2. Constitutional Review of Statutory Limits on Rights: Proportionality Scrutiny	266
3. Other Standards of Rights Restrictions	276
4. Concluding Remarks on Rights Limitations	282
5. Postscript on Rights and Duties	284
CONCLUSIONS	289
Endnotes	301
Bibliography	355
Index	367