

# FOOD AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN DEVELOPMENT

Volume I

Legal and institutional dimensions  
and selected topics

WENCHE BARTH EIDE  
UWE KRACHT  
(Eds)



intersentia

Antwerpen - Oxford

**L**

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

FOREWORD BY MARY ROBINSON . . . . .	xix
FOREWORD BY HARTWIG DE HAEN . . . . .	xxiii
TECHNICAL NOTE . . . . .	xxv
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS . . . . .	xxvii
OVERVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL BINDING HUMAN RIGHTS INSTRUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THIS BOOK . . . . .	xxxi
EDITORIAL INTRODUCTION . . . . .	xxxiii

## *I. FOOD IN THE HUMAN RIGHTS SYSTEM*

### CHAPTER 1.

#### THE IMPORTANCE OF ECONOMIC AND SOCIAL RIGHTS IN THE AGE OF ECONOMIC GLOBALISATION

ASBJORN EIDE . . . . .	3
1. Introduction . . . . .	3
2. The Human Rights Project in the Globalising Vision of the United Nations . . . . .	4
2.1. The Future World Order Envisaged by the UN Charter . . . . .	4
2.2. The Project to Make Human Rights Universal . . . . .	5
3. Globalisation through Interstate Cooperation: Initiatives and Failures 1945-1980 . . . . .	8
3.1. Conflicts East-West and North-South . . . . .	9
3.2. The Rise and Fall of the 'New International Economic Order' . . . . .	10
3.3. Breakdown: The Debt Crisis . . . . .	12
4. Corporate Globalisation through Neo-Liberal Market Extension . . . . .	13
4.1. Neo-Liberal Actors and Writers . . . . .	14
4.2. The Bretton Woods Institutions in New Roles . . . . .	15
4.3. The Washington Consensus . . . . .	16

Table of Contents

4.4.	WTO: Trade, not Development . . . . .	17
4.5.	From Wealth of Nations to Wealth of Corporations.....	18
5.	Assessing the Threefold Obstacles to Responsible Globalisation . . . . .	19
6.	Towards Rights-Based Globalisation . . . . .	22
6.1.	The Normative Basis for Rights-Based Development . . . . .	22
6.2.	The Millennium Declaration and Human Rights . . . . .	22
6.3.	Guidelines and Strategies. . . . .	24
6.4.	Illustration: Obligations and Strategies Regarding the Right to Food . . . . .	26
7.	In the Context of Globalisation . . . . .	27
7.1.	Rights-Based Development Cannot be Achieved through National Isolation . . . . .	27
7.2.	Required: Global Cooperation . . . . .	28
7.3.	Major Areas of Action.....	29
7.3.1.	The Human Rights Movement . . . . .	29
7.3.2.	International Monitoring and Complaint Mechanisms . . . . .	30
7.3.3.	Academia and Research . . . . .	31
7.3.4.	Corporate Responsibility. . . . .	31
7.3.5.	Controlling and Taxing Financial KJows. . . . .	32
7.3.6.	Involving the International Financial Institutions in Rights-Based Development . . . . .	33
7.3.7.	Redirecting the WTO: From Free Trade to Fair Trade . . . . .	35
8.	Concluding Remarks: Global Governance for Socially Conscious Globalisation . . . . .	36
	References . . . . .	37

CHAPTER 2.

DEMOCRACY AND THE POLITICS OF HUNGER

	DAN BANIK . . . . .	41
1.	Introduction . . . . .	41
1.1.	The Inheritance from Amartya Sen . . . . .	41
1.2.	India, Famines and Food Security. . . . .	42
1.3.	Dimensions of Democracy in India . . . . .	44
2.	The Politics of Government Intervention. . . . .	45
2.1.	Intervention in Food Markets . . . . .	45
2.2.	The Politics of Famine vs. Chronic Hunger and Malnutrition . . . . .	47
3.	Two Case Studies . . . . .	49
3.1.	Kalahandi, Orissa: Drought and Starvation Deaths. . . . .	49
3.2.	Purulia, West Bengal: Scoring Better Despite Poverty. . . . .	52

4. Examples of Adversarial Politics and Government Response.....	53
4.1. Government Response to Reports of Starvation Deaths in Kalahandi . . . . .	53
4.2. Bureaucratic Mobility as a Constraint to the Implementation of Public Programmes. . . . .	55
4.3. Press Coverage of Starvation Deaths.....	58
5. Concluding Remarks. . . . .	62
References. . . . .	63

### CHAPTER 3.

#### FROM FOOD SECURITY TO THE RIGHT TO FOOD

WENCHE BARTH EIDE. . . . .	67
1. Introduction. . . . .	67
2. The Right to Food in Context. . . . .	68
3. Beyond Food Production: The Shift to a Food Security Focus and Its Significance in the Food Debate over Three Decades. . . . .	70
3.1. Aggregated Food Security and the Critique to its Limitations. . . . .	70
3.2. Responses within the UN System. . . . .	73
3.3. Zooming in on Individuals' Access to Food in Context through Household Food Security. . . . .	75
4. Food Security in Shaping a Normative Foundation for the Right to Adequate Food Concept . . . . .	76
4.1. A Tool for Elaborating Rights and Corresponding Obligations: A 'Right to Food Matrix'. . . . .	77
4.2. A Forgotten Step: The EAO <i>Food "Security Compact</i> of the Mid-1980s - an Effort Towards a Quasi-Legal Instrument for Food Security. . . . .	78
5. Significant Further Developments Enabling a Pro-Rights Environment for the Food Security Debate. . . . .	80
5.1. . The First Study on the Right to Food for the United Nations. . . . .	81
5.2. The Vienna Conference on Human Rights. . . . .	82
5.3. Other UN Development Agencies. . . . .	83
5.4. Further Contributions from UN Human Rights Bodies. . . . .	85
5.5. Inter-Agency Potentials. . . . .	87
5.6. Non-Governmental Organisations. . . . .	89
5.7. ' Scholarly Institutions in Transition. . . . .	89
6. Concluding Remarks: 2005 and Beyond. . . . .	91
Appendix. "The Right to Food Matrix". . . . .	93
References. . . . .	94

**CHAPTER 4.**

**THE RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD IN HUMAN RIGHTS INSTRUMENTS: LEGAL NORMS AND INTERPRETATIONS**

WENCHE BARTH EIDE and UWE KRACHT. . . . . 99

1.	Introduction . . . . .	99
2.	The Right to Adequate Food in the International Normative Framework of Human Rights . . . . .	100
3.	Defining the Content of the Right to Food and the Broad Parameters for its Implementation . . . . .	104
3.1.	General Comment No. 12 on the Right to Adequate Food (GC12)'	105
3.1.1.	The Normative Content of the, Right to Adequate Food ..	105
3.1.2.	State Obligations and Responsibilities of Society as a Whole . . . . .	106
3.1.3.	National Implementation_____	108
3.1.4.	On the Issue of 'Justiciability' of the Right to Food . . . . .	110
3.1.5.	The International Dimension, of the Right to Food.....	112
3.2.	From Expert Interpretation to Stakeholder-Owned Guidelines for Action . . . . .	113
4.	Concluding Reflections on Food as a Human Right . . . . .	114
	References . . . . .	116

**CHAPTER 5.**

**WHOSE RIGHT TO FOOD? VULNERABLE GROUPS AND THE HUNGRY POOR**

UWE KRACHT. . . . . 119

1.	Introduction . . . . .	119
2.	Trends in Under- and Malnutrition and Related Poverty. . . . .	120
2.1.	Undernutrition . . . . .	121
2.2.	Protein-Energy Malnutrition in Preschool Children . . . . .	122
2.3.	Overnutrition . . . . .	122
2.4.	Micronutrient Deficiency Disorders. . . . .	123
2.5.	Hunger, Malnutrition and Poverty. . . . .	124
2.6.	Trends in Global Poverty. . . . .	125
3.	Who are the Hungry Poor?_____	125
3.1.	Hunger and Poverty - Still a Predominantly Rural Phenomenon . . . . .	125
3.2.	Who Are the Poor: Poverty-Vulnerable Population Groups. . . . .	126.
3.3.	Toward a Food- and Nutrition-Focused Typology of Vulnerable Groups and Associated Vulnerability Causes. . . . .	128

3.4. Need for a Sharper Focus on Vulnerable Groups and the Hungry Poor in Country-Specific Contexts. . . . .	132
4. Conclusion . . . . .	133
Annex Tables. . . . .	134
References. . . . .	138

CHAPTER 6.

THE INTERRELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN THE RIGHT TO FOOD AND OTHER HUMAN RIGHTS

MARGRET VIDAR . . . . .	141
1. Introduction . . . . .	141
2. Right to Non-Discrimination . . . . .	142
3. Right to Health . . . . .	144
4. Right to Education . . . . .	146
5. Right to Work . . . . .	147
6. Right to Social Security. . . . .	148
7. Rights Related to Water. . . . .	150
8. Rights Related to Land. . . . .	151
9. Cultural Rights. . . . .	153
10. Freedom of Opinion, Expression and Information. . . . .	155
11. Freedom of Assembly and Association. . . . .	156
12. Right to Participation. . . . .	157
13. Right to Proper Administration of Justice. . . . .	158
14. Conclusions. . . . .	159
References. . . . .	159

II. *LEGAL AND INSTITUTIONAL DIMENSIONS*

CHAPTER 7.

JUSTICIABILITY OF SOCIO-ECONOMIC RIGHTS: REFLECTIONS ON NORWEGIAN AND SOUTH AFRICAN DEBATE AND EXPERIENCE

MARGIT TVEITEN. . . . .	163
1. Socio-Economic Rights as a Necessary Control of Government Action ..	163
2. Socio-economic Rights in South African and Norwegian Law. . . . .	166
3. Arguments Against Justiciability. . . . .	170
4. Justiciability in Practice in South Africa . . . . .	172
4.1. Interference in Resource Allocation. . . . .	172

## Table of Contents

4.2. Vagueness . . . . .	174
4.3. Court Cases are Resource Demanding . . . . .	175
4.4. Retroactivity. . . . .	176
4.5. Dependence on Specific Facts and Parties. . . . .	176
4.6. Complexity. . . . .	177
5. Judicialisation as a Threat to Democracy. A Norwegian Perspective . . . . .	178
6. "Judicial Democracy". . . . .	179
7. Conclusion . . . . .	183
References . . . . .	184

## CHAPTER 8.

### THE ROLE OF FRAMEWORK LEGISLATION IN REALISING THE RIGHT TO FOOD: USING SOUTH AFRICA AS A CASE STUDY OF THIS NEW BREED OF LAW

SIBONILE KHOZA . . . . .	187
1. Introduction . . . . .	187
2. Constitutional Obligations. . . . .	189
2.1. Interpreting the Right to Food.in Textual, Social and Historical Contexts. . . . .	190
2.2. Applying International Law in the Domestic Legal System . . . . .	192
3. The Right to Food in International Law and the Emergence of- Framework Law. . . . .	193
3.1. Framework Law: A New Breed of Law. . . . .	193
3.2. Content of Framework Law. . . . .	194
3.3. Crucial Issues Concerning the Content of Framework Law. . . . .	195
3.4. The Benefits of Framework Legislation. . . . .	196
4. The Significance of Framework Law in South Africa . . . . .	197
4.1. The Complexity of the Food Situation. . . . .	197
4.2. The Nature of Recognition Accorded to the Right to Food . . . . .	198
4.3. Emerging Domestic Trends Towards Framework Law. . . . .	199
4.4. Relevant Human Rights Principles and Democratic,Norms for a Framework Law Process. . . . .	200
5. Towards a Framework Law Approach in South Africa: The Integrated Food Security Strategy and the Food Security Draft Bill. . . . .	200
5.1. The Integrated Food Security Strategy (IFSS). . . . .	201
5.2. The National Food Security Draft Bill. . . . .	202
6. Conclusion . . . . .	203
References . . . . .	203

## CHAPTER 9.

THE ROLE OF THE UN HUMAN RIGHTS BODIES IN PROMOTING  
AND PROTECTING THE RIGHT TO FOOD

SALLY-ANNE WAY. . . . .	205
1. Introduction . . . . .	205
2. The UN Commission on Human Rights. . . . .	208
2.1. The Commission and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. . . . .	208
2.2. Establishing a Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food of the Commission. . . . .	209
2.3. Challenges Facing the Commission. . . . .	211
3. The Sub-Commission on the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights. . . . .	212
3.1. The Sub-Commission and the Right to Food. . . . .	213
3.2. Challenges Facing the Sub-Commission. . . . .	214
4. The Committee on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights. . . . .	215
4.1. The CESCR and the Right to Food. . . . .	215
4.2. Participation of Non-Governmental Organisations in the Supervisory Process. . . . .	216
4.3. Challenges Facing the Committee. . . . .	217
5. The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights. . . . .	219
5.1. The OHCHR and the Right to Food. . . . .	220
5.2. Challenges Faced by the OHCHR. . . . .	221
6. The Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food of the Commission on Human Rights. . . . .	222
6.1. The Mandate of the Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food. . . . .	222
6.2. Challenges Faced by the Special Rapporteur. . . . .	224
7. Conclusions. . . . .	225
References. . . . .	226

## CHAPTER 10.

PROGRAMMING WITH A HUMAN RIGHTS APPROACH: A UNICEF  
EXPERIENCE IN OPERATIONAL PRACTICE

FABIO SABATINI. . . . .	229
1. Introduction. . . . .	229
2. A Sequential Approach. . . . .	231
2.1. Initial Obstacles in Introducing the Concept to Staff and Allies. . . . .	231
2.2. Early Identification of Programmatic Steps. . . . .	232
3. Operationalising the Approach: Zimbabwe 1998-2002. . . . .	242

3.1.	Sensitisation and Training on HRBAP Concepts and CCD Operations .....	242
3.2.	Using Rights-Based Analysis as Prerequisite for Project Implementation .....	244
3.3.	A First Case Study: Integrated Management of Childhood Illnesses (IMCI) .....	245
4.	Programmatic Implications of a HRBAP .....	245
4.1.	The Value Added of HRBAP: From Participation to Obligation ...	245
4.2.	HRBAP Demands Process-Conscious and Outcome-Oriented Programming .....	247
4.3.	Multisectoral and Community-Driven Work is Unavoidable under a HRBAP .....	247
4.4.	HRBAP Requires Expanding Partnerships with Civil Society. ...	248
5.	Benefits of HRBAP .....	248
5.1.	Community Level .....	249
5.2.	Local Authority Level .....	250
5.3.	At All Levels .....	250
6.	Possible Threats to HRBAP Operationalisation .....	251
6.1.	Organisational Doubts .....	251
6.1.1.	HRBAP is Process Oriented and Management Intensive ..	251
6.1.2.	CCD is 'too' Cost-Effective and Not Necessarily Linked to Programme Deliverables .....	251
6.2.	Community-Related Challenges .....	252
6.2.1.	A Time Intense Process with Spread-Out Benefits. ....	252
6.2.2.	Sustaining Community Commitment .....	252
6.2.3.	Committed Leadership .....	253
6.2.4.	Access to Relevant Information .....	253
6.2.5.	Uneven Participation and Process Ownership .....	253
6.2.6.	Breaking the Dependency Syndrome .....	253
6.3.	System-Related Challenges .....	254
6.3.1.	The Persistence of the Project Approach .....	254
6.3.2.	Weak Institutional Environment .....	254
6.3.3.	The Challenge to Generate a Bottom-Up Approach within a Top-Down Environment .....	255
6.3.4.	Community/District Interface: Positioning CMs in Relation to District Level Technocrats .....	256
6.3.5.	The Need to Strengthen the Quality of Community Assessment and Analysis .....	256
6.3.6.	Advocacy for Sustained Support and Resource Mobilisation .....	257

7.	Untapped Opportunities and Potentials for Mainstreaming . . . . .	257
7.1.	Assessment of Capacity of Local Authorities. . . . .	257
7.2.	Monitoring and Evaluation and Reporting Systems for Impact Assessment . . . . .	257
7.3.	Systematic, Large-Scale Training on HRBAP/CCD. . . . .	258
8.	Conclusion: Changing Minds, Changing Lives. . . . .	258
	References. . . . .	258

CHAPTER 11.

DEVELOPING VOLUNTARY GUIDELINES FOR IMPLEMENTING  
THE RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD: ANATOMY OF AN  
INTERGOVERNMENTAL PROCESS

	ARNE OSHAUG. . . . .	259
1.	Introduction. . . . .	259
2.	Anatomy of the Intergovernmental Process 2003-2004. . . . .	264
2.1.	IGWG I - 24 <sup>th</sup> to 26 <sup>th</sup> March 2003. . . . .	264
2.2.	IGWG II - 27 <sup>th</sup> to 29 <sup>th</sup> October 2003. . . . .	266
2.3.	IGWG Inter-Sessional Meeting - 2 <sup>nd</sup> to 5 <sup>th</sup> February 2004. . . . .	270
2.4.	IGWG III - 5 <sup>th</sup> to 9 <sup>th</sup> July 2004. . . . .	272
2.5.	'Friends of the Chair' Meeting - 20 <sup>th</sup> to 22 <sup>nd</sup> September 2004. . . . .	275
3.	Overall Assessment: How Useful are the New Voluntary Guidelines? . . . . .	276
	References. . . . .	280

*1/7. ASPECTS OF THE RIGHT TO FOOD, - SELECTED TOPICS*

CHAPTER 12.

THE RIGHT TO FOOD OF INDIGENOUS PEOPLES

	SIRI DAMMAN. . . . .	285
1.	Introduction. . . . .	285
2.	Background . . . . .	286
2.1.	Indigenous Food Insecurity and Malnutrition. . . . .	286
2.2.	Who are the Indigenous Peoples and What Characterises their Ways of Life? . . . . .	287
2.3/	Evolution of Indigenous Peoples' Rights. . . . .	289
2.3.1.	The International Historical Context. . . . .	289
2.3.2.	Non-Discrimination, Affirmative Action, and Special Rights for Indigenous Peoples. . . . .	292

Table of Contents

2.3.3. The Right to Culture of Indigenous Peoples. . . . .	293
3. Two Cases. . . . .	295
3.1. Indigenous Vulnerability. . . . .	295
3.2. The Case of Jujuy. . . . .	297
3.2.1. The Food Security Situation. . . . .	297
3.2.2. Legal Protection. . . . .	298
3.2.3. The Right to Land: Intentions and Realities. . . . .	299
3.3. The Case of Nunavut. . . . .	301
3.3.1. Land and Food Security. . . . .	301
3.3.2. Legal Protection and Governance. . . . .	306
4. Principles Guiding the Exploration of the Indigenous Right to Food . . . .	307
5. Self-Determination or an Actively Involved State? Delineating Options for State Responsibilities' . . . . .	309
5.1. Contrasting and Comparing Two Models. . . . .	309
5.2. Emerging Coinciding Problems - a Function of the Assisting State Model in Action?. . . . .	310
5.3. Can Lessons Be Drawn From the Nunavut Experience to Other Situations?. . . . .	311
6. Practical Options for a Positive Change. . . . .	312
6.1. The Significance of the Human Rights Standards and Their Interpretation for Indigenous Peoples. . . . .	312
6.2. Culture, including Food Culture, is at the Core of Indigenous Food Security. . . . .	313
6.3. Concluding Remarks. . . . .	315
References. . . . .	318

CHAPTER 13.

BREASTFEEDING: BABY'S RIGHT AND MOTHER'S DUTY?

ELISABET HELSING. . . . . 323

1. Introduction: Issues and Premises. . . . .	323
1.1. Why are Human Rights Important in Breastfeeding?. . . . .	323
1.2. Key Definitions and Standards in Infant Feeding . . . . .	324
1.3. Provisions Relevant to Breastfeeding in International Human Rights Instruments. . . . .	324
1.4. Identifying Obligations - Building the Case. . . . .	325
2. Biology Re-Examined: Is Species Specific Food Important for the Young?. . . . .	326
2.1. Each Species has its Own Baby Food Recipe and Strategy for Care. . . . .	326

2.2.	The Human Mammal is no Exception . . . . .	327
2.3.	Is it Biologically Possible to Force a Mother to Breastfeed?. . . . .	328
2.4.	Some Situations where Breast may not be best . . . . .	328
2.5.	Is there any Alternative to the Species-Specific Milk?. . . . .	330
2.5.1.	Why the Cow?. . . . .	331
3.	The Historical Contribution of the Health Profession to the Replacement of Breastfeeding . . . . .	332
3.1.	Emergency Feeding of Babies - Historically a Risky Business. . . . .	332
3.2.	Reproduction of the Labour Force Becoming "Modernised". . . . .	333
3.3.	Artificial Feeding Made Safe. . . . .	333
3.4.	The Medical Connection - a Dangerous Liaison . . . . .	333
3.4.1.	New Milk in New Vessels. . . . .	334
3.5.	Bottle-Feeding Routines for Making Breastmilk?. . . . .	335
3.6.	Why did it Happen, and whose Interests were Served?. . . . .	335
4.	Introducing Human Rights to the Breast Feeding Movement and Discourse . . . . .	337
4.1.	Meeting a Series of Dilemmas. . . . .	337
4.2.	Does Baby's Right Lead to Mother's Duty?. . . . .	338
5.	Mothers' Human Right to Breastfeed. . . . .	339
5.1.	Feminist Perspectives. . . . .	339
5.1.1.	Equality at All Costs?. . . . .	340
5.1.2.	Having it Both Ways?. . . . .	340
5.2.	The Role of Sexuality. . . . .	341
5.2.1.	Differences Between Male and Female Sexuality. . . . .	341
5.2.2.	Breasts both for Fun and Food. . . . .	341
6.	"Informed Choice" - and Shirking Responsibility?. . . . .	342
7.	Defining the Obligations of States in,a; Human Rights Perspective . . . . .	343
7.1.	The Turning of the Tide - Breastfeeding Reclaimed . . . . .	343
7.1.1.	Re-Capturing the Art of Breastfeeding and the Science of Studying Human Milk. . . . .	343
7.1.2.	Taking back Control of "The Human Experiment". . . . .	344
7.1.3.	Important Documents Supportive of the Right to Practice Breastfeeding. . . . .	344\
7.1.4.	The Long Step from Theory to Action. . . . .	347
7.2.	Establishing a Framework for State Obligations. . . . .	348
7.3.	Implications for Policy. . . . .	349
7.4.	Lessons Learnt by the Nordic Experience. . . . .	350
8.	Conclusion: A Question of Rights and Conditional Duties and Obligations of the State. . . . .	351
	References. . . . .	353

CHAPTER 14.

HIV/AIDS, FOOD SECURITY AND HUMAN RIGHTS: CONCEPTS AND LINKAGES

IDA-ELINE ENGH . . . . .	357
1. In Search of Linkages . . . . .	357
2. The Problem . . . . .	359
3. An Organising Framework . . . . .	360
4. Establishing the Linkages . . . . .	361
4.1. Food Security and HIV/AIDS . . . . .	362
4.1.1. Impacts of the HIV/AIDS Epidemic on Food Security . . . . .	363
4.1.2. Impacts of Food Insecurity on Vulnerability to HIV/AIDS . . . . .	365
4.2. HIV/AIDS and Human Rights Relevant to Food . . . . .	366
4.2.1. HIV/AIDS and the Right to Health . . . . .	367
4.2.2. HIV/AIDS, Discrimination and Stigmatisation . . . . .	369
4.2.3. The Rights of Children Affected and Orphaned by HIV/AIDS . . . . .	371
4.3. Linking the Three Dimensions: HIV/AIDS, Food Security and the Right to Food . . . . .	372
5. Implications for the State: An Attempt to Define its Obligations for Addressing HIV/AIDS and Food Insecurity . . . . .	374
5.1. Addressing HIV/AIDS and Food Insecurity . . . . .	374
5.2. Identifying Obligations . . . . .	375
5.2.1. The Obligation to Respect . . . . .	376
5.2.2. The Obligation to Protect . . . . .	377
5.2.3. The Obligation to Facilitate . . . . .	378
5.2.4. The Obligation to Provide . . . . .	379
6. The Need to Specify Obligations <i>and</i> Capacities to Meet Them . . . . .	380
7. Conclusion . . . . .	384
References . . . . .	385

CHAPTER 15.

HIV/AIDS, INFANT FEEDING AND HUMAN RIGHTS

GEORGE KENT . . . . .	391
1. Questionable Coercion . . . . .	391
2. Uncertainty Regarding HIV Transmission through Breastfeeding . . . . .	393
2.1. Definitions and Indicators of Transmission and Infection . . . . .	393
2.2. Likelihood of Transmission . . . . .	396
2.3. Morbidity and Mortality . . . . .	397

2.4.	The Protective Effects of Breastfeeding . . . . .	399
3.	Health Outcomes and Implications for Feeding Choices. . . . .	400
4.	Global Policy Recommendations on HIV/AIDS and Infant Feeding . . . .	403
5.	Human Rights Law and Principles Relating to Infant Feeding . . . . .	404
5.1.	Provisions of Specific Interest in the International Human Rights Instruments. . . . .	404
5.2.	Focus on the Principle of Informed Choice. . . . .	408
6.	Is HIV/AIDS Exceptional?. . . . .	410
6.1.	Evidence, or Lack of it?. . . . .	410
6.2.	Who Decides?. . . . .	411
6.3.	The AFASS Conditions. . . . .	412
7.	Summary and Conclusion. . . . .	413
	Appendix. Observational Research on HIV and Infant Feeding. . . . .	417
	References. . . . .	420

**CHAPTER 16.**

**THE RIGHT TO FOOD, THE RIGHT TO BENEFIT FROM SCIENCE  
AND THE TRIPS AGREEMENT**

	HANS MORTEN HAUGEN. . . . .	425
1.	Introduction. . . . .	425
1.1.	Historical Context . . . . .	427
2.	Relevant Human Rights Provisions. . . . .	428
2.1.	The Right to an Adequate Standard of Living, Including the Right to Food . . . . .	428
2.2.	The Right to Enjoy the Benefits of Scientific Progress. . . . .	429
2.3.	The Right of Authors to Benefit from Moral and Material Interests of Production . . . . .	431
2.4.	The Right of People to their Natural Resources. . . . .	433
3.	Intellectual Property Rights and the TRIPS Agreement under International Economic Law. . . . .	434
3.1.	The Nature of IPRs under International Economic Law. . . . .	434
3.2.	Objectives and Contents of the TRIPS Agreement. . . . .	436
3.3.	Patent Protection and Plant Breeders Rights. . . . .	437
4.	Assessing the Impact of TRIPS. . . . .	441
4.1.	Will Patents Generate Long-Term Growth and Facilitate , Investment in Developing Countries?. . . . .	441
4.2.	Commercial Interests and Human Rights. . . . .	443
5.	Conflicts and Violations. . . . .	444
5.1.	Defining and Identifying Conflict between Treaties. . . . .	444

Table of Contents

5.2. Adoption of Incompatible Treaties as 'Violation of Human Rights'	445
5.3. Will Human Rights be Considered in Discussions over TRIPS? ..	446
6. The Relationship between the TRIPS Agreement and the ICESCR. . . . .	448
6.1. Initial Observations. . . . .	448
6.2. Making Full Use of All Available Resources. . . . .	449
6.3. Obligations Relating to Science and Scientific Applications. . . . .	450
6.4. Obligations Relating to the Right to Self Determination and the Prohibition against Deprivation of Means of Subsistence. . . . .	452
6.5. Indigenous Peoples. . . . .	453
7. Concluding Remarks. . . . .	453
References. . . . .	455

CHAPTER 17.

MODERN HUMAN RIGHTS LAW IN SPECIFIC CULTURAL  
CONTEXTS: AN EXAMPLE OF TRADITIONAL POWER AND  
FOOD ENTITLEMENT SYSTEMS

A. BYARUHANGA RUKOOKO. . . . .	461
1. Introduction. . . . .	461
2. Traditional Power Systems in Uganda. . . . .	462
2.1. God, Spirits and Food. . . . .	462
2.2. Kings, the Nobility and Food. . . . .	464
2.3. Communal Obligation to Brothers and Sisters. . . . .	465
2.4. Communal Production and Distribution of Food. . . . .	466
2.5. Communal Taboos and Food. . . . .	468
2.6. "Nyineeka" as a Concept of Power Relation. . . . .	469
2.6.1. Nyineeka and the Access to Food. . . . .	469
2.6.2. Nyineeka's Power at the Site of Eating. . . . .	471
3. Changing Society and Food Security. . . . .	472
4. Some Reflections on Traditional Food Entitlements Systems from a Modern Human Rights Perspective. . . . .	474
5. Conclusion. . . . .	476
References. . . . .	477

ANNEX 1. GENERAL COMMENT NO. 12 ON THE RIGHT TO FOOD ... 479

ANNEX 2. VOLUNTARY GUIDELINES TO SUPPORT THE  
PROGRESSIVE REALIZATION OF THE RIGHT TO ADEQUATE  
FOOD IN THE CONTEXT OF NATIONAL FOOD SECURITY. . . . . 487

# FOOD AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN DEVELOPMENT

## Volume II

Evolving issues and  
emerging applications

WENCHE BARTH EIDE

UWE KRACHT

(Eds-.)

intersentia-.

Antwerpen - Oxford



# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<b>FOREWORD BY EIBE RIEDEL</b> .....	xxiii
<b>FOREWORD BY MUHAMMAD ALI DHANSAY</b> .....	xxvii
<b>TECHNICAL NOTE</b> .....	xxxI
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS</b> .....	xxxiii
<b>OVERVIEW OF INTERNATIONAL AND REGIONAL BINDING HUMAN RIGHTS INSTRUMENTS REFERRED TO IN THIS BOOK</b> ....	xxxix
<b>EDITORIAL INTRODUCTION</b> .....	xli

## *1. EVOLVING CONCEPTUAL DEBATE*

### **CHAPTER 1.**

#### **ECONOMICS AND HUMAN RIGHTS - TWO SEPARATE WORLDS ?**

YVES BERTHELOT	3
1. Introduction	3
2. Factors of the non-dialogue	4
2.1. The Cold War and the priority to growth	4
2.2. The power of the GDP	5
2.3. A mechanical view of development	7
2.4. The excesses of free trade	8
2.5. Neo-liberalism and globalisation	10
3. Missed opportunities of a clear dialogue and first breakthrough	12
3.1. Land reform	13
3.2. Basic needs	14
3.3. The world conferences	15
3.4. The Human Development Index	15
4. Conditions for a fruitful dialogue	16
4.1. Necessity of a dialogue	16

Table of Contents

4.2. Challenges for a fruitful dialogue . . . . .	18
4.2.1. The cultural challenge. . . . .	18
4.2.2. The statistical challenge. . . . .	18
4.2.3. The justiciability challenge. . . . .	19
4.2.4. The extraterritoriality challenge. . . . .	20
5. Conclusion . . . . .	21
References. . . . .	22

CHAPTER 2.

ECONOMICS AND HUMAN RIGHTS - TOWARDS EMPOWERED DEVELOPMENT

ALFREDO SFEIR-YOUNIS. . . . .	25
I.	
1. Introduction. . . . .	25
2. Two initial propositions. . . . .	30
2.1. The economic dimensions of jurisprudence. . . . .	31
2.2. Legal obligations and their impacts on material resource allocations. . . . .	32
3. Collective rights and world demography. . . . .	34
4. The intellectual journey of economic development institutions: an illustration of the present state of play. . . . .	37
4.1. The three stages in the intellectual journey. . . . .	37
4.1.1. The first stage: formal rejection. . . . .	37
4.2.2. The second stage: 'we do it already'. . . . .	38
4.2.3. The third stage: positive, 'a window opening' . . . . .	39
4.2. Bilateral donors and multilateral organisations: perspectives at a glance. . . . .	39
4.2.1. Some highlights of the review. . . . .	42
5. Some concerns expressed by economists. . . . .	43
5.1. Examples of concerns. . . . .	43
5.1.1. The issues of human rights and economic development are not new. . . . .	43
5.2.2. Human rights and economic growth. . . . .	44
5.2.3. Process and rule-making. . . . .	45
5.2.4. Organisational issues. . . . .	46
5.2.5. Political concerns. . . . .	46
5.2.6. From positive to normative economics. . . . .	46
5.2.7. Rights of people to things vs. rights in people's relations . . . . .	47
5.2.8. Rights and violations of rights. . . . .	47
5.2.9. Private vs. public good. . . . .	47
5.2.10. An optimal mix of instruments and policies?. . . . .	48

5.2.11. Impacts of economic policy on human rights. . . . .	49
5.2.12. Spatial and inter-temporal choices. . . . .	49
6. Human rights in welfare economics. . . . .	50
6.1. The conceptual debate. . . . .	50
6.2. Human rights as initial endowments. . . . .	51
6.3. Human rights as capital. . . . .	52
7. Positive approach to economics and human rights: a primer. . . . .	54
8. Final thoughts: is there a need for a paradigm shift? . . . . .	60
References. . . . .	61
Additional readings. . . . .	61

CHAPTER 3.

FILLING THE ANTHROPOLOGIST CHAIR IN THE FOOD AND HUMAN RIGHTS IN DEVELOPMENT DEBATE

THOMAS J. MARCHIONE . . . . . 63

1. Introduction. . . . .	63
2. The anthropologists' rejection of the universal declaration of human rights. . . . .	64
3. Consequences for the international development debate. . . . .	65
4. Anthropology's efforts to engage in human rights. . . . .	68
5. An illustration of engagement in food security and the right to food in Malawi. . . . .	71
6. Conclusions: Reentering the debate . . . . .	75
References. . . . .	78

CHAPTER 4.

POLITICAL SCIENCE, HUMAN RIGHTS AND THE RIGHT TO FOOD DISCOURSE

BARD A. ANDREASSEN. . . . . 81

1. Introduction. . . . .	81
2. The political science neglect of human rights. . . . .	82
3. Citizenship, state expansion and democratisation — antecedents and new interest in human rights studies in political science. . . . .	86
4. Political science and human rights - the new interest. . . . .	89
5. Food and human rights as subject for political science. . . . .	96
5.1. Food and the State ~. . . . .	96
5.2. Food and conflict. . . . .	98

## Table of Contents

5.3. Food and international politics. . . . .	100
5.4. Food, distributive justice and human rights. . . . .	101
6. Conclusion: Food and human rights - what has political science to offer? . . . . .	102
References. . . . .	104

### CHAPTER 5.

#### THE RIGHT TO FOOD IN THE PERSPECTIVE OF THE RIGHT TO DEVELOPMENT

ARJUN SENGUPTA. . . . .	107
1. Introduction. . . . .	107
2. 'The right to development' and 'rights-based development'. . . . .	110
3. Food and the right to development - understanding the opposition to the notion of the right to food. . . . .	112
3.1 The vagueness of the right. . . . .	114
3.2 Objections to the right to food as a legal human right. . . . .	119
3.3 Opposition from economists. . . . .	120
4. What should be the core content of the human right to food? . . . . .	123
5. Development policy for realising the right to food. . . . .	128
5.1 Some examples. . . . .	128
5.2 General elements for framework legislation. . . . .	130
6. International cooperation and a Development Compact. . . . .	132
7. Conclusion. . . . .	134
References. . . . .	135

### CHAPTER 6.

#### STATE OBLIGATIONS REVISITED

ASBJORN EIDE. . . . .	137
1. The right to adequate food is a human right. . . . .	137
2. On the right to food in human rights law, and on human rights as 'law'. . . . .	139
2.1. Human rights as such are not subjective rights under positive law. . . . .	139
2.2. When and how do human rights become 'law' and subjective rights? . . . . .	140
2.3. The scope of state obligations. . . . .	143

3.	The tripartite typology of state obligations: origin and purpose. . . . .	144
3.1.	Overcoming the ideological schism. . . . .	144
3.2.	Foundation of the typology in the texts of international instruments. . . . .	147
3.3.	The relation to obligations of 'conduct' and of 'result'. . . . .	147
3.4.	Categories of state obligations, not 'levels of obligations'. . . . .	148
3.5.	The category of respect for economic, social and cultural rights - its wide significance. . . . .	150
3.6.	The category of 'protection' - its wide range. . . . .	150
3.7.	The division of 'fulfil' into 'facilitate' and 'provide'. . . . .	152
3.8.	Should 'promotion' be seen as a separate category of state obligations?. . . . .	153
4.	Benefits, criticisms and responses. . . . .	153
5.	A note on the main users of the tripartite typology. . . . .	154
5.1.	Its usefulness for the monitoring bodies. . . . .	154
5.2.	Its use by NGOs and Civil Society: the case of FIAN. . . . .	155
5.3.	The Voluntary Guidelines and the approximation of the typology. . . . .	156
6.	Conclusion. . . . .	157
	References. . . . .	158

## II. EMERGING IMPLEMENTATION IN SPECIFIC COUNTRIES

### CHAPTER 7.

#### PROMOTING A RIGHTS-BASED APPROACH TO FOOD AND NUTRITION SECURITY IN UGANDA

J.M. ALIRO OMARA. . . . . 161

1.	Background. . . . .	161
2.	The rights regime in Uganda. . . . .	163
3.	Overview of the policy and legislative framework for food and nutrition. . . . .	165
3.1.	The food and nutrition-related policy agenda. . . . .	166
3.2.	Related legislation. . . . .	168
4.	The difficult question of vulnerability. . . . .	168
5.	Towards a rights-based food and nutrition policy and implementation strategy. . . . .	170
5.1.	The Uganda Food and Nutrition Policy 2003. . . . .	170
5.2.	The Uganda Food and Nutrition Strategy. . . . .	172
5.3.	Critical observations on the strategy. . . . .	173

6.	The important question of monitoring . . . . .	175
6.1.	Overview. . . . .	175
6.2.	Critical observations on the monitoring strategy. . . . .	176
7.	UFNP framework law. . . . .	178
8.	Conclusions and challenges ahead. . . . .	178

CHAPTER 8.

THE HUMAN RIGHT TO FOOD MOVEMENT IN BRAZIL

FLAVIO LUIZ SCHIECK VALENTE . . . . .	181
---------------------------------------	-----

1.	Introduction . . . . .	181
2.	A framework for understanding human rights approaches to food and nutritional security. . . . .	182
2.1.	The main components of food and nutrition security. . . . .	184
2.2.	Human rights governance and food and nutrition security. . . . .	185
3.	The Brazilian experience: from the struggle against hunger to the human right to food . . . . .	186
3.1.	The quest for the inclusion of food and nutritional security in the national agenda . . . . .	186
3.1.1.	Civil society mobilisation and the changing of the State . . . . .	187
3.1.2.	National Food Security Council - CONSEA. . . . .	188
3.1.3.	I National Food Security Conference. . . . .	189
3.1.4.	The Cardoso government 1995-2002. . . . .	189
3.2.	Intent and practice of human rights in Brazil . . . . .	190
3.2.1.	Human rights institutions in Brazil . . . . .	190
3.2.2.	The government and human rights. . . . .	191
3.2.3.	The national rapporteurship project . . . . .	191
3.3.	Merging food and nutritional security and human rights. . . . .	192
3.4.	The operationalization of the human right to adequate food and nutrition in Brazil . . . . .	195
3.4.1.	The second Cardoso government (1999-2002). . . . .	195
3.4.2.	The Federal Government elected in 2002: priority to food and nutritional security and the realisation of the human right to food. . . . .	198
3.4.3.	Recent developments towards the operationalisation of the human right to adequate food . . . . .	201
3.4.4.	Continued non-realisation and violations of the HRtAF . . . . .	204
4.	The interaction between the human right to food and food and nutritional security: lessons learned. . . . .	206
4.1.	Food and nutrition security concept . . . . .	206

4.2.	The distance between the intent and practice is institutionalised ..	206
4.3.	Fragmentation of public policies. ....	206
4.4.	Stronger international multilateral instruments are needed. ....	207
4.5.	State and government are not monolithic institutions. ....	207
4.6.	Social mobilisation. ....	208
4.7.	State-civil society partnership and the central role of human rights capacity building for all. ....	208
4.8.	The role of multistakeholder public policy councils. ....	209
4.9.	Integration of human rights and food and nutritional security movements. ....	209
4.10.	The need for independent and autonomous human rights institutions and recourse instruments. ....	209
4.1.1.	Strengthening the effectiveness of human right to food claim mechanisms is a crucial tool for empowerment and social change. ....	210
4.12.	Food and nutritional security and human rights on the national development agenda. ....	211
5.	Conclusions. ....	211
	References. ....	212

## CHAPTER 9.

### FROM INTERNATIONAL TO DOMESTIC LAW: THE CASE OF THE INDIAN SUPREME COURT IN RESPONSE TO ESC RIGHTS AND THE RIGHT TO FOOD

	COLIN GONSALVES. ....	215
	,l	
1.	Introduction. ....	215
2.	International instruments incorporated and applied in India. ....	216
2.1.	Locus-standi in the enforcement of ESC rights. ....	218
2.2.	Burden of proof. ....	218
2.3.	Mandatory orders and their implementation. ....	219
2.4.	Resources. ....	219
2.5.	ESC rights. ....	220
2.6.	WTO regulations and the optional protocol: double standards? ...	221
3.	The right to food: the Indian experience. ....	223
3.1.	Public Distribution System (PDS). ....	223
3.2.	Poverty line. ....	225
3.3.	Poverty line excludes many hungry persons. ....	226
4.	The petition in the Supreme Court. ....	226
5.	Conclusions. ....	234

References . . . . . 236

CHAPTER 10.

THE RIGHT TO FOOD IN SIERRA LEONE

ABDULAI IALLOH . . . . . 237

1. Introduction . . . . . 237

2. Socio-economic profile of Sierra Leone . . . . . 239

3. Poverty and vulnerability . . . . . 240

3.1. Who are the poor and vulnerable in Sierra Leone . . . . . 242

3.2. Where are the poor and vulnerable . . . . . 244

3.3. Why the poverty and vulnerability . . . . . 246

3.3.1. Regional dimensions . . . . . 246

3.3.2. The civil war . . . . . 248

3.3.3. Dietary habits and implications for food security . . . . . 248

3.3.4. Cultural dimensions: secret societies and religion . . . . . 250

4. The obligations of the state . . . . . 250

4.1. Laying the foundation for peace building and good governance . . . . . 251

4.2. Symposium on the operationalisation of the right to food in Sierra Leone . . . . . 253

4.1.2. The obligation to respect . . . . . 256

4.2.3. The obligation to protect . . . . . 257

4.2.3. The obligation to fulfil/facilitate . . . . . 259

4.2.4. The obligation to fulfil/provide . . . . . 264

5. Conclusion - a vision worth fulfilling . . . . . 267

References . . . . . 267

CHAPTER 11.

REFLECTIONS ON THE RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD IN MALI

OUSMANE OUMAROU SIDIBE . . . . . 271

1. Introduction . . . . . 271

2. The nature of hunger and malnutrition in Mali . . . . . 272

2.1. The food and nutrition situation . . . . . 272

2.2. The causes of hunger and malnutrition . . . . . 273

2.2.1. Poverty . . . . . 274

2.2.2. The vulnerability of the systems of production . . . . . 275

2.3. The communities most exposed to the hunger and malnutrition . . . . . 276

2.3.1. Women and children . . . . . 277

2.3.2. Other vulnerable groups. . . . .	277
3. The national policy for food security. . . . .	279
4. Affirming the right to adequate food in Mali. . . . .	283
4.1. Establishing a legal and regulatory framework. . . . .	283
4.2. Mali's assets for the implementation of the right to food . . . . .	284
4.2.1. A tradition of solidarity and mutual help. . . . .	285
4.2.2. A democratic context favourable to the promotion of the human rights. . . . .	286
5. An emerging dialogue on a human rights approach to food and nutrition security in Mali. . . . .	288
5.1. The Forum on the Right to Adequate Food, Bamako March 2003 .	288
5.2. Follow-up of the Forum. . . . .	290
6. Conclusion. . . . .	291
References. . . . .	292

### *III. APPLICATION AND PROMOTION SELECTED ISSUES AND CONTEXTS*

#### **CHAPTER 12.**

#### **THE INDIVISIBILITY OF WATER, LAND AND FOOD IN LOCAL, NATIONAL AND INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW: THE CASE OF WOMEN'S GARDENS IN MHONDORO, ZIMBABWE**

ANNE HELLUM. . . . . 297

1. Introduction. . . . .	297
2. The right to livelihood - water, land and food. . . . .	298
2.1. The centrality of water for livelihood. . . . .	298
2.2. The human right to water. . . . .	300
2.3. Adequate water. . . . .	301
2.4. Local norms regarding water. . . . .	302
3. Family gardens in Mhondoro: livelihood in terms of food and cash . . . .	303
4. Livelihood, equality and access to land and water in 'local law'. . . . .	309
4.1. Drinking water. . . . .	310
4.2. Livelihood: garden land with available water. . . . .	311
4.3. 'Local law', the right to livelihood and non-discrimination. . . . .	312
5. National water reform, user pay, primary and commercial water. . . . .	313
5.1. Water reform. . . . .	314
5.2.' The user pay principle in practice. . . . .	316

Table of Contents

6. Converging international and local concerns: obligations of states in meeting the human right to water. . . . . 317

6.1. HRBAD, poverty/elimination and the right to livelihood, food and water. . . . . 318

6.2. Meeting the right to safe, adequate and available water. . . . . 319

6.3. Between productive and domestic: the right to non-discriminatory access. . . . . 321

7. The potential of HRBAD. . . . . 322

References. . . . . 324

CHAPTER 13.

EXPERIENCES FROM CASE RELATED RIGHT TO FOOD WORK:  
LESSONS LEARNED FOR IMPLEMENTATION

MICHAEL WINDFUHR. . . . . 331

1. Introduction; 20 years of FIAN work in retrospective. . . . . 331

2. Case based human rights work on the right to adequate food. . . . . 332

2.1. Form and function of case based interventions on the right to adequate food. . . . . 333

2.2. Overview of cases and interventions. . . . . 334

2.3. Relevance of case related experiences in standard-setting processes. . . . . 335

3. Main affected groups - current victims of hunger and malnutrition . . . . 337

3.1. A hunger typology. . . . . 337

3.2. Victim groups in FIAN cases. . . . . 339

3.3. A regional perspective. . . . . 341

4. Lessons learned . . . . . 344

4.1. Nature of state obligations. . . . . 344

4.2. Forms of violations. . . . . 346

4.3. Relevant policy areas / themes / issues. . . . . 348

5. Improving the implementation of action towards the right to adequate food. . . . . 349

5.1. The role and importance of the State. . . . . 350

5.2. Focus on marginalised groups and individuals. . . . . 351

5.3. Focus on agriculture and rural development . . . . . 352

5.4. Documentation and monitoring . . . . . 353

5.5. Exigibility vs. justiciability - finding the right strategy. . . . . 354

5.6. Obligations and responsibilities of other actors than states. . . . . 355

6. Concluding remarks . . . . . 356

References. . . . . 357

## CHAPTER 14.

HUMAN RIGHTS IN THE UNITED NATIONS SYSTEM STANDING  
COMMITTEE ON NUTRITION (SCN)

UWE KRACHT, WENCHE BARTH EIDE and URBAN JONSSON ..... 359

1.	Introduction .....	359
2.	The Working Group on Nutrition, Ethics and Human Rights .....	360
2.1.	Initial attitudes among ACC-SCN members and observers .....	361
2.2.	Working Group activities .....	362
2.2.1.	Building understanding among SCN members (1994-96) .....	362
2.2.2.	Moving towards co-operative action (1997-99) .....	364
2.2.3.	Consolidating the SCN's role as a human rights actor (2000-2004) .....	371
2.2.4.	Final breakthrough (2005-2006) .....	377
3.	The unfinished agenda: time for further consolidation and breaking new ground .....	380
3.1.	Further reflections on the role of the WG on NEHR .....	382
3.2.	Selected action priorities .....	383
4.	Final remark .....	384
	References .....	385

## CHAPTER 15.

A FOOD AND NUTRITION POLICY FRAMEWORK TO HELP REALISE  
THE HUMAN RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD - LESSONS FROM  
FOUR COUNTRY CASE STUDIES , I

ROGER SHRIMPTON ..... 387

1.	Introduction .....	387
2.	Background to the case studies .....	388
2.1.	Applicability of lessons learnt .....	388
2.2.	Objectives of case studies .....	389
2.3.	Country case study process .....	390
3.	Food and nutrition programmes in national development plans .....	392
4.	The setting of national food and nutrition goals and objectives .....	395
5.	A food and nutrition policy framework as a basis for framework legislation for the right to adequate food .....	396
5.1.	Food production .....	398
5.2.	Food processing, fortification, labelling and marketing .....	400
5.3.	Food supplementation .....	401

Table of Contents

5.4. Micronutrient supplementation . . . . .	402
5.5. Nutrition education for dietary and life style change . . . . .	403
5.6. Food and nutrition in emergencies . . . . .	404
6. Institutional arrangements . . . . .	404
6.1. National level institutions . . . . .	405
6.2. Sub-national institutional arrangements . . . . .	405
6.3. Vulnerability and prioritization . . . . .	408
6.4. Human resources and capacity . . . . .	409
7. Monitoring, evaluating and communicating rights violations . . . . .	409
7.1. Monitoring and evaluation . . . . .	410
7.2. Reporting on rights violations versus coverage of needs . . . . .	411
7.3. Communication of food and nutrition problems and issues . . . . .	411
8. Conclusions . . . . . I;	412
References . . . . .	419

*IV. LOOKING TO THE FUTURE*

CHAPTER 16.

MONITORING THE HUMAN RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD  
AT COUNTRY LEVEL: CHALLENGES AND NEEDED ACTIONS

ARNE OSHAUG . . . . .	425
1. Introduction . . . . .	425
1.1. Monitoring as an integral part of realising the right to adequate food . . . . .	426
1.2. Previous concerns with human rights monitoring by the United Nations . . . . .	428
1.3. A note on links and vocabulary of Voluntary Guideline 17. . . . .	429
2. Defining monitoring in the context of the human right to adequate food . . . . .	430
2.1. Rights-based monitoring . . . . .	431
3. The link between human rights based development and human rights based monitoring . . . . .	432
4. Opportunities and challenges . . . . .	434
4.1. Opportunities . . . . .	434
4.2. Challenges . . . . .	435
4.3. How to address two challenges: institutional and legal framework and capacity development . . . . .	438
4.3.1. Institutional framework . . . . .	438
4.3.2. Capacity development . . . . .	441

5.	Selected practical methods to monitor the human right to adequate food . . . . .	442
5.1.	Planning and conducting assessments of relevance to the right to adequate food . . . . .	443
5.1.1.	Elements of assessments relevant to the right to adequate food . . . . .	443
5.1.2.	Gathering information for the assessments . . . . .	445
5.1.3.	Disseminating assessment information . . . . .	446
5.2.	Analysis that can facilitate a baseline assessment and subsequent monitoring . . . . .	447
5.2.1.	Selected analytical tasks . . . . .	447
5.2.2.	Undertaking analyses and assessments as part of monitoring . . . . .	449
6.	Summary of some lessons learned . . . . .	450
7.	Where to start? . . . . .	452
8.	Concluding remarks . . . . .	453
	References . . . . .	455

## CHAPTER 17.

### HISTORY AND IMPLICATIONS FOR FAO OF THE GUIDELINES ON THE RIGHT TO ADEQUATE FOOD

ISABELLA RAE, JULIAN THOMAS and MARGRET VIDAR . . . . . 457

1.	Introduction . . . . .	457
2.	The backdrop of early developments . . . . .	459
2.1.	FAO encountering the right to fo'od . . . . .	459
2.2.	FAO facilitating debate on the right to food . . . . .	460
2.2.1.	The 1996 World Food Summit . . . . .	461
2.2.2.	The World Food Summit: <i>five years later</i> . . . . .	463
3.	FAO coaching the new right to food guidelines . . . . .	464
3.1.	Intergovernmental Working Group arrangements . . . . .	464
3.2.	Negotiation process . . . . .	465
3.3.	Role of different actors . . . . .	467
3.3.1.	The Bureau of the Intergovernmental Working Group . . . . .	468
3.3.2.	NGOs . . . . .	469
3.3.3.	Human rights bodies . . . . .	470
3.3.4.	The Core Group in the Secretariat . . . . .	470
3.4.	Overcoming obstacles . . . . .	472
3.5.	A successful outcome . . . . .	475

Table of Contents

4.	FAO embracing the right to food . . . . .	476
4.1.	Institutionalisation of the right to food in FAO.....!	477
4.2.	Normative activities. . . . .	478
4.3.	Communication, education and awareness raising . . . . .	480
4.4.	Examples of support to national implementation. . . . .	482
4.4.1.	Brazil . . . . .	483
4.4.2.	Mozambique. . . . .	484
4.4.3.	Sierra Leone. . . . .	485
5.	Conclusion . . . . .	486
	References. . . . .	487

CHAPTER 18. I ' UN SYSTEM CAPACITY DEVELOPMENT FOR HUMAN RIGHTS THROUGH THE 'ACTION 2' PROGRAMME

URBAN JONSSON. . . . . 489

1.	Introduction . . . . .	489
2.	Towards a common understanding in the UN of a rights-based development approach. . . . .	491
2.1.	The United Nations and human rights. . . . .	491
2.2.	The UN Reform and human rights. . . . .	492
2.3.	A common understanding . . . . .	494
3.	The preparation of the Action 2 Project . . . . .	496
4.	The Action 2 Project . . . . .	500
4.1.	Objectives, sub-objectives and expected outcomes. . . . .	500
4.1.1.	The achievement of the first sub-objective: . . . . .	500
4.1.2.	The achievement of the second sub-objective. . . . .	501
4.1.3.	The achievement of the third sub-objective. . . . .	501
4.2.	Implementation. . . . .	502
4.2.1.	Progress in capacity building support . . . . .	502
4.2.2.	Progress in joint programme development . . . . .	503
4.2.3.	Programming acceptance and implementation of international human rights standards at country level . . . . .	503
4.3.	A common learning package on HRA. . . . .	504
4.4.	Piloting at country level. . . . .	505
4.5.	Plans for 2006. . . . .	506
5.	Analysis of the Action 2 Programme. . . . .	506
5.1.	On the relationship between human development and human rights: a challenge to the Action 2 Programme. . . . .	507
6.	Some conclusions. . . . .	509

References . . . . .	511
<b>CHAPTER 19.</b>	
<b>ENHANCING CROSS-DISCIPLINARY SKILLS TO ANALYSE AND PROMOTE FOOD AND NUTRITION AS HUMAN RIGHTS - THE ROLE OF ACADEMIC INSTITUTIONS</b>	
WENCHE BARTH EIDE . . . . .	513
1. Introduction: Human resource building - key to advancing the right to adequate food and.nutritional health . . . . .	513
2. How far have we gone? . . . . .	519
3. Academic courses linking food, nutrition and human rights . . . . .	523
3.1. From pioneering trials towards mainstream inclusion in educational programmes - still a way to go? . . . . .	523
3.2. The Oslo initiative and experience. . . . .	524
3.3. Initiatives in the United States. . . . .	526
3.3.1. A record of institutional experiences.....	526
3.3.2. From classroom to on-line from Hawai'i . . . . .	529
3.4. The right to food at Wageningen University and Research Centre, The Netherlands. . . . .	531
4. Conceptual and cognitive challenges in combining nutrition science, practice and human rights . . . . .	534
4.1. Understanding conceptual and terminological differences in scholarly traditions . . . . .	535
4.2. Conceptual clashes - or intedisciplinary amalgamation? . . . . .	537
4.3. A ten year assessment and progress. . . . .	538
5. Conclusion: A continuing institutional and pedagogical challenge. . . . .	539
5.1. Bulding alliances for mutual learning . . . . .	539
5.2. Making the topic researchable!. . . . .	540
5.3. Advancing advocacy about the need for human rights-based training in food and nutrition. . . . .	~f. 542
References. . . . .	543