



DE GENEVE

INSTITUT DE HAUTES ETUDES INTERNATIONALES ET
DU DEVELOPPEMENT

**EXPLOSIVE REMNANTS OF WAR
AND THE PROTECTION OF HUMAN BEINGS
UNDER PUBLIC INTERNATIONAL LAW**

THESE
presentee a l'Universite de Geneve
pour l'obtention
du grade de Docteur en relations Internationales
(droit international)

par

Sylvain BEAUCHAMP
(Canada)

These No. 802

**Geneve
2008**

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF FREQUENT ABBREVIATIONS.....	V
INTRODUCTION.....	1
CHAPTER I. HISTORICAL AND FACTUAL BACKGROUND OF EXPLOSIVE REMNANTS OF WAR (ERWS)'.....	7
A. INTERNATIONAL ARMED CONFLICTS.....	7
1. <i>The Battle of Solferino of 1859</i>	8
2. <i>The First World War</i>	9
3. <i>The Second World War</i>	11
4. <i>Selected Post WWII conflicts</i>	13
(a) Viet Nam.....	13
(b) Laos.....	14
(c) Lebanon.....	15
B. NON-INTERNATIONAL ARMED CONFLICTS.....	17
C. ERWs IN TIMES OF PEACE.....	19
D. COMMON FACTUAL CHARACTERISTICS OF ALL EXPLOSIVE REMNANTS OF WAR.....	21
CHAPTER II. INTERNATIONAL LEGISLATIVE HISTORY OF ERWS.....	22
A. UNITED NATIONS HISTORY.....	22
B. TOWARDS THE BANNING OF MINES UNDER INTERNATIONAL LAW.....	27
C. THE GENESIS OF THE 2003 CCW PROTOCOL V AND ITS AFTERMATH.....	31
1. <i>The Road to the 2003 CCW Protocol V</i>	31
2. <i>Mines Other Than Anti-Personnel Mines (MOTAPM)</i>	35
3. <i>The Banning of Cluster Bombs</i>	38
CHAPTER III. DEFINING EXPLOSIVE REMNANTS OF WAR.....	42
CHAPTER IV. PRELIMINARY LEGAL ISSUES: WHAT, WHEN AND WHO.....	45
A. WHAT: GENERAL DISTINCTIONS IN LEGAL REGIMES ACCORDING TO THE TYPES OF WEAPONS THAT CREATE ERWS.....	45
1. <i>Anti-Personnel Landmines</i>	46
2. <i>Anti-vehicle Landmines</i>	48
3. <i>Seamines and Anti-Ship Watermines</i>	49
4. <i>Other Types of Weapons Containing Explosives Which May Become ERWs</i>	53
5. <i>Abandoned Weapons</i>	55
6. <i>Synthesis of the International Legal Regimes Applicable to ERWs</i>	55
B. WHEN: DEALING WITH ERWS THROUGH TIME - INTERTEMPORAL LAW ISSUES.....	57
1. <i>The Notion of Intertemporal Law</i>	58
2. <i>The Intertemporal Law Doctrine Applied to Juridical Facts</i>	60
3. <i>The Intertemporal Law Doctrine Applied to Juridical Acts</i>	64

(a)	Validity of Treaties.....•.....	65
(b)	Interpretation of Treaties.....	66
(c)	Legal Notions Contained in Treaties.....'	68
(d)	Factual Notions Contained in Treaties.....:	73
(e)	Legal Obligations or Rights Contained in Treaties.....	75
(1)	The Temporal Effect of Treaties.....	77
(i)	The Retroactive Effect of Treaty Provisions.....	77
(ii)	The Immediate Effect of Treaties on Continuously Existing Situations.....	79
(g)	Treaties of a Humanitarian Character.....	81
(h)	Norms of Customary International Law.....	86
4.	<i>Synthesis of, the Intertemporal Law Doctrine Applied to ERWs.</i>	'87
C.	WHO: FOCUS ON THE INTERNATIONAL LEGAL PERSONALITY OF INDIVIDUALS AND NON-STATE ACTORS.....	89
/.	<i>Non-State Entities Under International Humanitarian Law.</i>	90
(a)	Individuals as Subjects of IHL.....:	90
(b)	Collective Entities as Legal Subjects of IHL.....	95
2.	<i>Non-State Entities and International Human Rights Law.</i>	101
3.	<i>Non-State Actors and ERWs in Concrete Situations.</i>	109
	CHAPTER V. SUBSTANTIVE INTERNATIONAL LAW APPLICABLE TO ERWS.	112
A.	INTERPLAY BETWEEN HUMANITARIAN LAW AND HUMAN RIGHTS LAW.....	114
/.	<i>Implications of the Interplay Between IHL and IHRL for Explosive Remnants of War.</i>	115
2.	<i>Historical and Normative Background of the Relationship.</i>':	117
(a)	Conventional Human Rights and Humanitarian Law Evolution During the 20 th Century.....	118
(b)	Treatment of the Relationship by Human Rights Judicial and Treaty Bodies.....	129
(c)	Specialized Humanitarian Law Organs.....	135
(d)	Case-law of the International Court of Justice.....•.....	139
(e)	IHL as the <i>Lex Specialis</i> in Situations of Interplay With IHRL.....,.....:	143
(i)	The <i>Lex Specialis</i> Principle in International Law.....^.....	146
(ii)	Do IHL and IHRL Qualify-as "Lex"?.....,.....:	147
(iii)	If IHL is <i>Specialis</i> , What is the <i>Lex Generalis</i> ?.....	148
3.	<i>Substantive Interplay Between IHL and IHRL.</i>	152
B.	SUBSTANTIVE INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW APPLICABLE TO ERWS..... r	158
1.	<i>Introductory Remarks on IHL.</i>•.....	158
(a)	Necessity of an "Armed Conflict".....	160
(b)	Types of Aimed Conflicts.....'	169
(i)	International Armed Conflicts.....	172
(ii)	Armed Conflicts Not of an International Character.....:	179
1.1	Common Article 3 Types of Non-international Armed Conflicts.....	180
1.2	1977 Additional Protocol II Types of Non-international Armed Conflicts.....	184
(c)	The Role of Humanity: The Martens Clause and Elementary Considerations of Humanity.....	187
(i)	The Martens Clause as a Distinct Source of International Law?.....:	191
(d)	The Obligation to Respect and Ensure Respect of IHL.....•.....	200

(i)	The Obligation to Respect IHL.....	200
(ii)	The Obligation to Ensure Respect of IHL.....	204
2.	<i>The Applicability of IHL in Concrete ERW-plagued Contexts</i>	210
3.	<i>Relevant IHL Obligations Outside the Context of Armed Conflicts</i>	214
(a)	Development of New Weapons.....'	215
(i)	Historical Background of Article 36 of the 1977 Additional Protocol I.....	215
(ii)	Content of the Obligations Contained in Article 36 of the 1977 Additional Protocol I.....	217
(b)	Obligation to Disseminate International Humanitarian Law.....	221
(c)	IHL Obligations Outside the Context of Armed Conflicts.....	222
(i)	• National Implementing Legislation.....'	223
(ii)	Legal Advisors in Armed Forces....."	223
(iii)	Obligations Towards Other High Contracting Parties.....	224
(iv)	Obligations Deriving from Instruments Other than the Geneva Conventions.....	224
4.	<i>Relevant IHL Obligations During Armed Conflicts</i>	225
(a)	Obligation to Refrain From Using Weapons Known or Suspected to Cause ERWs?.....	225
(i)	During an International Armed Conflict.....	226
1.1	Principle of Distinction (and Corollary: Precautions).....	227
1.1 .(i)	The Prohibition of Attacks Against Civilians and Civilian Objects.....	229
1.1 .(ii)	The Principle of Precautions in General.....	235
1.2	Prohibition on Indiscriminate Attacks and Principle of Proportionality.....	242
1.2.(i)	Nature of the Prohibition.....	243
1.2.(ii)	The Principle of Proportionality.....	247
1.2.(iii)	The Principle of Precautions With Respect to the Prohibition on Indiscriminate Attacks.....	255
1.3	Prohibition to Use Weapons that May Cause Superfluous Injuries or Unnecessary Suffering.....	260
1.4	The Protection of Civilian Objects and of the Natural Environment.....	267
1.4.(i)	The Protection of Civilian Objects.....•	267
1.4.(ii)	The Protection of the Natural Environment.....	270
(ii)	Relevant IHL Principles and Rules During a Non-international Armed Conflict.....	281
(b)	Obligation to Warn/Inform Civilians before and/or after an Attack that May Create ERWs?.....	283
(c)	Obligation of Information and/or Cooperation with, and Assistance to, the Other Parties to the Conflict?.....:	288
(d)	Obligation to Remove ERWs?.....	292
(i)	Deriving from the General Protection Enjoyed by the Civilian Population.....	294
(ii)	Deriving from the Law of Military Occupation.....	297
(iii)	Deriving from International Law Pertaining to Mines.....	300
(iv)	Deriving from the 2003 CCW Protocol V.....	304
C.	SUBSTANTIVE INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW APPLICABLE TO ERWS.....	310
1.	<i>The Right to Life</i>	312
(a)	The Right to Life under International Human Rights Law.....	312
(b)	The Right to Life and Explosive Remnants of War.....	319
2.	<i>The Right to Security</i>	323
(a)	The Right to Security under International Human Rights Law.....	323
(b)	The Right to Security and Explosive Remnants of War.....	326
3.	<i>The Rights of the Child Under International Law</i>	327
4.	<i>Other International Human Rights Relevant to ERWs</i>	332

D.	SUBSTANTIVE INTERNATIONAL REFUGEE LAW APPLICABLE TO ERWS.....	335
1.	<i>Sources and Key Principles of International Refugee Law</i>	336
2.	<i>International Refugee Law and Explosive Remnants of War</i>	339
(a)	Can the Presence of ERWs Justify That an Individual be Considered as a "Refugee"?.....	340
(i)	Well-founded Fear.....	340
(ii)	Persecution.....	341
(iii)	Specific Grounds of Persecution	344
• (iv)	Impact of the Availability of Internal Resettlement Possibilities.....	348
(b)	Non-refoulement and Explosive Remnants of War.....	351
	GENERAL CONCLUSION	355
A.	SUMMARY FINDINGS ON PRIMARY RULES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW.....	357
1.	<i>Preliminary and Ancillary Legal Issues</i>	357
(a)	The Issue of Intertemporal law.....	357
(b)	The Legal Subjectivity of Non-State Actors.....	358
(c)	The Variety of Legal Regimes Applicable to ERWs.....	359
(d)	Interplay between international humanitarian and human rights law.....	361
2.	<i>Substantive Legal Issues</i>	363
(a)	International Humanitarian Law.....	364
(i)	Use of Weapons Which May Create Explosive Remnants of War.....	364
(ii)	Removal of Explosive Remnants of War Under International Humanitarian Law.....	368
(iii)	Obligation of cooperation.....	369
(b)	International Human Rights Law.....	370
(c)	International Refugee Law.....	371
B.	BRIEF OVERVIEW OF SECONDARY RULES OF INTERNATIONAL LAW.....	371
	GENERAL BIBLIOGRAPHY	384
	APPENDIX A - PROTOCOL V TO THE 1980 CCW (2003)	441
	APPENDIX B - IHL PROVISIONS RELEVANT TO ERWS	449
	APPENDIX C - PROTOCOL II TO THE 1980 CCW (1980)	454
	APPENDIX D - AMENDED PROTOCOL II TO THE 1980 CCW (1996)	457
	APPENDIX E - OTTAWA TREATY (1997)	468
	APPENDIX F - OSLO TREATY ON CLUSTER BOMBS (2008)	478