

IT Service-Oriented Investment Analysis

A Comparison of
In-House versus Software-as-a-Service
Deployment Solutions

DISSERTATION
of the University of St. Gallen,
Graduate School of Business Administration,
Economics, Law and Social Sciences (HSG)
to obtain the title of
Doctor Oeconomiae

submitted by

Susanne Glissmann

from

Germany

approved on the application of

Prof. Dr. Walter Brenner
and
Prof. Dr. Lutz M. Kolbe

Dissertation no. 3685

Pro BUSINESS Verlag, Berlin 2010

Table of Contents

1	Introduction	1
1.1	Motivation	1
1.2	Objective & Audience	3
1.3	Origin & Dissertation Framework	4
1.4	Research Methodology	6
1.5	Structure	9
2	Conceptual Foundations	11
2.1	Business Engineering	11
2.2	Industrialized Information Management	14
2.3	Software-as-a-Service	24
2.4	Summary & Research Gap	36
3	Relevant Investment Analysis Approaches	38
3.1	Decision Theory	38
3.2	Sensitivity Analysis	41
3.3	SaaS Investment Analysis	44
3.4	IIM Cost Accounting	48
3.5	Manufacturing Resource Planning	52
4	Case Studies	55
4.1	Selection of Cases	55
4.2	Audi AG's Selection of an In-House Solution	57
4.3	Plantronics, Inc.'s Selection of a SaaS Solution	63
4.4	Cross-Case Analysis	67
5	Method Proposal for IT Service-Oriented Investment Analysis	70
5.1	Method Introduction	71
5.2	Phase 1 – Customer Requirements Analysis	83
5.3	Phase 2 – Pre-Selection of In-House & SaaS Solutions	105
5.4	Phase 3 – Manufacturing Specification of In-House & SaaS Solutions	119
5.5	Phase 4 – Capacity Requirements Planning for In-House & SaaS Solutions	136
5.6	Phase 5 – Cost Accounting of In-House & SaaS Solutions	157
5.7	Phase 6 – Final Selection between In-House or SaaS Solution	185
5.8	Conclusion	204
6	Summary	209
	References	211

Table of Contents (in detail)

1	Introduction	1
<i>1.1</i>	<i>Motivation</i>	<i>1</i>
<i>1.2</i>	<i>Objective & Audience</i>	<i>3</i>
<i>1.3</i>	<i>Origin & Dissertation Framework</i>	<i>4</i>
<i>1.4</i>	<i>Research Methodology</i>	<i>6</i>
<i>1.5</i>	<i>Structure</i>	<i>9</i>
2	Conceptual Foundations	11
<i>2.1</i>	<i>Business Engineering</i>	<i>11</i>
2.1.1	Characteristics of Business Engineering	11
2.1.2	Method Engineering	12
2.1.3	Contribution to this Dissertation	14
<i>2.2</i>	<i>Industrialized information management</i>	<i>14</i>
2.2.1	Origin and Principles	14
2.2.2	Characteristics of IT Services and IT Products	16
2.2.3	Role Model of IT Service Providers	20
2.2.4	Contribution to this Dissertation	23
<i>2.3</i>	<i>Software-as-a-Service</i>	<i>24</i>
2.3.1	IT Outsourcing	24
2.3.2	Application Service Provision	27
2.3.3	Software-as-a-Service Continuum	30
2.3.4	Contribution to this Dissertation	36
<i>2.4</i>	<i>Summary & Research Gap</i>	<i>36</i>
3	Relevant Investment Analysis Approaches	38
<i>3.1</i>	<i>Decision Theory</i>	<i>38</i>
3.1.1	Elements of Decision Models	39
3.1.2	Decision Process	40
3.1.3	Evaluation for this Dissertation	41

3.2 Sensitivity Analysis	41
3.2.1 Risk Assessment	42
3.2.2 Monte Carlo Analysis	43
3.2.3 Evaluation for this Dissertation	43
3.3 SaaS Investment Analysis	44
3.3.1 Academic Research	44
3.3.2 Market Analysts	46
3.3.3 Evaluation for this Dissertation	48
3.4 IIM Cost Accounting	48
3.4.1 Integrated IT Cost Tables	49
3.4.2 IT Product-Oriented Cost Accounting	50
3.4.3 Evaluation for this Dissertation	52
3.5 Manufacturing Resource Planning	52
3.5.1 Functions	52
3.5.2 Evaluation for this Dissertation	54
4 Case Studies	55
4.1 Selection of Cases	55
4.2 Audi AG's Selection of an In-House Solution	57
4.2.1 Company	57
4.2.2 Investment Analysis	58
4.2.3 Findings	62
4.3 Plantronics, Inc.'s Selection of a SaaS Solution	63
4.3.1 Company	63
4.3.2 Investment Analysis	63
4.3.3 Findings	67
4.4 Cross-Case Analysis	67

5	Method Proposal for IT Service-Oriented Investment Analysis	70
5.1	Method Introduction	71
5.1.1	Objects of Comparison	71
5.1.2	Requirements	72
5.1.3	Meta Model	74
5.1.4	Procedure Model	77
5.1.5	Fictitious Example	80
5.2	Phase 1 – Customer Requirements Analysis	83
5.2.1	IT Product Contract	84
5.2.2	Sales Specifications of IT Services	87
5.2.2.1	Core Services	89
5.2.2.2	Support Services	91
5.2.3	Sales Plans of IT Services	97
5.2.3.1	Core Services	98
5.2.3.2	Support Services	101
5.3	Phase 2 – Pre-Selecdon of In-House & SaaS Solutions	105
5.3.1	Blueprints of IT Production Alternatives	106
5.3.2	Blueprints of IT Development Alternatives	113
5.3.3	Decision-Making by Internal IT Service Provider	116
5.4	Phase 3 – Manufacturing Specification of In-House & SaaS Solutions	119
5.4.1	Bill of Services & Work Plans of IT Production Alternatives	120
5.4.1.1	Core Services	121
5.4.1.2	Support Services	125
5.4.1.3	Maintenance Services	129
5.4.2	Project Plans of IT Development Alternatives	131
5.5	Phase 4 – Capacity Requirements Planning for In-House & SaaS Solutions	136
5.5.1	Capacities & Service Levels of IT Production Alternatives	138
5.5.1.1	Core Services	139
5.5.1.2	Support Services	147
5.5.1.3	Maintenance Services	152

5.5.2	Capacities & Service Levels of IT Development Alternatives	155
5.6	<i>Phase 5 – Cost Accounting of In-House & SaaS Solutions</i>	157
5.6.1	Costs of IT Production Alternatives	162
5.6.1.1	Core Services	163
5.6.1.2	Support Services	172
5.6.1.3	Maintenance Services	175
5.6.2	Costs of IT Development Alternatives	179
5.7	<i>Phase 6 – Final Selection between In-House or SaaS Solution</i>	185
5.7.1	Decision-Making by Internal IT Service Provider	186
5.7.1.1	Influencing Factors for IT Production Alternatives	191
5.7.1.2	Influencing Factors for IT Development Alternatives	197
5.7.2	Decision-Making by Customer Company	199
5.7.2.1	Influencing Factors for IT Product Contract	200
5.7.2.2	Influencing Factors for Sales Specifications of IT Services.	201
5.8	<i>Conclusion</i>	204
5.8.1	Fulfillment of Requirements	204
5.8.2	Limitations & Need for Further Research	205
5.8.3	Outlook	207
6	Summary	209
	References	211