

Marta M. Michatek

Right to Defence in EU Competition Law: The Case of Inspections

**These Acceptee par la Faculte de droit, le 28 aout 2015,
sur proposition du Professeur Walter A. Stoffel (premier rapporteur)
et du Professeur Marc Amstutz (second rapporteur)**

Warsaw 2015

**University of Warsaw
Faculty of Management Press**

Contents – summary

List of acronyms	13
Introduction	15
Chapter I. Right to defence	27
Chapter II. Protection of the right to defence in Europe	71
Chapter III. Commission's powers of inspection	119
Chapter IV. Procedural fines and periodic penalty payments	161
Chapter V. Fishing expeditions	181
Chapter VI. Subsequent electronic searches of copied hard drives	201
Chapter VII. Right to privacy	213
Chapter VIII. Principle of proportionality	231
Chapter IX. Legal professional privilege	245
Chapter X. Privilege against self-incrimination	275
Chapter XI. Remedies and judicial review	311
Conclusions	369
Bibliography	387

Contents

List of acronyms	13
Introduction	15
Chapter I. Right to defence	27
1. Introduction	27
2. History	28
3. Terminology	30
4. Nature	36
4.1. Natural right	36
4.2. Fundamental right	38
4.3. Subjective right	40
4.4. Procedural importance – from judicial to decisional	41
4.5. Material or formal right	43
4.6. Inalienable right	43
4.7. Autonomous right	44
5. Definition	47
5.1. Law	48
5.2. Case law	49
5.3. Doctrine	50
6. Content	53
7. Related notions	55
7.1. Rule of law	56
7.2. Procedural justice	61
7.3. Right to good administration	63
Chapter II. Protection of the right to defence in Europe	71
1. Multitude of regimes of protection	71
1.1. UN Universal Declaration of Human Rights	72
1.2. International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	73
2. European Convention on Human Rights	74

2.1. Guaranteed rights	76
2.2. Scope of application	77
2.3. Right to defence	79
2.4. Role of the ECtHR	84
2.5. Methods of interpretation of the EConHR	85
3. European Union (Charter of Fundamental Rights)	91
3.1. EU history	91
3.2. Fundamental Rights in the EU	93
3.2.1. From case law to legislation	93
3.2.2. Charter of Fundamental Rights	97
3.3. Role of the Court in introducing the protection of fundamental rights in the EU	103
3.4. Fundamental rights in relation to the fundamental freedoms	107
3.5. Right to good administration	109
3.6. Right to defence	111
Chapter III. Commission's powers of inspection	119
1. Introduction	119
2. Commission investigations	121
3. Basic regulation and scope of Commission inspections	122
4. Types of Commission inspections	123
5. Commission's powers of inspection	129
5.1. Power to enter any premises, land and means of transport of undertakings and associations of undertakings	130
5.2. Power to examine the books and other records related to the business, irrespective of the medium on which they are stored	134
5.3. Power to take or obtain in any form copies of or extracts from such books or records	141
5.4. Power to seal any business premises and books or records for the period and to the extent necessary for the inspection	143
5.5. Power to ask any representative or member of staff of the undertaking or association of undertakings for explanations on facts or documents relating to the subject-matter and purpose of the inspection and to record the answers	147
5.6. Inspections of "other premises"	153
6. Limitations of the Commission's power of inspection	157
Chapter IV. Procedural fines and periodic penalty payments	161
1. Introduction	161
2. Rules regarding imposition of procedural fines and periodic penalty payments	162
3. Relevant case-law of the CJEU	165

3.1. Case <i>E.ON. Energie</i>	165
3.2. Case <i>Suez Environnement</i>	168
3.3. Case <i>Energetycky</i>	169
4. Further remarks	177
5. Conclusions	179
Chapter V. Fishing expeditions	181
1. Introduction	181
2. Obligation to state the reasons	182
3. Case <i>Nexans</i>	187
4. Case <i>Deutsche Bcihn</i>	194
5. Conclusions	199
Chapter VI. Subsequent electronic searches of copied hard drives	201
1. Introduction	201
2. Approach adopted by the ECtHR	202
3. Assessment of EU practice	204
4. Conclusions	210
Chapter VII. Right to privacy	213
1. Introduction	213
2. Standard of protection of the right to privacy set out by the ECtHR...	214
3. Approach adopted by the CJEU	219
4. Charter of Fundamental rights of the EU	222
5. Compatibility of the EU inspection regime with Article 8 EConHR....	223
5.1. Question of prior authorisation	225
5.2. Power to inspect other premises	227
6. Conclusions	228
Chapter VIII. Principle of proportionality	231
1. Introduction	231
2. Approach adopted by the ECtHR	231
3. Principle of proportionality in the EU	232
4. Importance of the principle of proportionality in the context of the Commission's inspections	234
5. Conclusions	243
Chapter IX. Legal professional privilege	245
1. Introduction	245
2. Standard set out by the ECtHR	246
3. Approach adopted by the CJEU	250
3.1. In-house lawyers	258
3.2. Non-EU lawyers	261
3.3. Objective scope and waiver of LPP	262

Contents

4. Importance of LLP during the Commission's inspections	264
5. Remedy	269
6. Conclusions	271
Chapter X. Privilege against self-incrimination	275
1. Introduction	275
2. Standard of privilege against self-incrimination set out by the ECtHR	276
3. Approach on the privilege against self-incrimination adopted by the CJEU	287
4. Waiver of the privilege against self-incrimination and the leniency program	296
5. Importance of the privilege against self-incrimination during the Commission's inspections	299
6. Remedy	307
7. Conclusions	308
Chapter XL Remedies and judicial review	311
1. Introduction	311
2. Principle of effective judicial protection	312
3. Judicial review in EU	316
4. Prior judicial authorisation of the police assistance	320
5. Authorisation of inspections of other premises	326
6. Need of immediate remedy	328
6.1. Action for damages	333
6.2. Compatibility with the requirements set out by the ECtHR	336
7. Judicial review of the decisions imposing pecuniary penalties	337
8. Judicial review of the inspection's decisions	347
8.1. Application for interim measures	351
8.2. Right to oppose	354
8.3. Action for damages	355
8.4. Independence of the review of inspection decisions	355
8.5. Standard of judicial review	357
9. Conclusions	365
Conclusions	369
Bibliography	387
I. Literature	387
II. Legal acts	405
III. Case-law of the ECtHR	406
IV. Case-law of the CJEU	412
V. Case-law of the Commission	427
VI. Others	428